

Report on Joint Training Programme on Gender and Child Rights





Organized by



Course Team

Sarojini Ganju Thakur, IAS (Retd.) Senior Gender Expert

Ranjana Chopra, IAS Joint Director/ Director NGS-NIAR

Tejinder Singh Sandhu Program Manager Governance UNICEF India Country Office

Anjali S. Chauhan Associate Professor NGC-NIAR, LBSNAA

Documentation, Photographs, Design & Layout

Shafqat Hussain



Report on Joint Training Programme on Gender and Child Rights

November 18 to 22, 2013

Organized at:

Indira Bhawan Lal Bahadur Shastru National Academy of Administration (LBSNAA) Mussoorie (Uttrarakhand), India



Organized by:









 \bigcirc





Table of Contents



Page 09 to 26

Page 27 to 43

Page 44 to 53





Acronyms & Abbreviations

AHTU	Anti-Human Trafficking Unit
AWC	Anganwadi Centre
AWW	Anganwadi Worker
BMI	Body Mass Index
BPL	Below Poverty Line
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CRC	Child Rights Convention
CSR	Child Sex Ratio
DRDA	District Rural Development Agency
DWCRA	Development of Women and Children in Rural Areas
GAD	Gender and Development
GDI	Gender Development Index
GDP	Gross domestic Product
GEM	Gender Empowerment Measure
GII	Gender Inequality Index
GRB	Gender Responsive Budget
HDI	Human Development Index
ICDS	Integrated Child Development Services
ICPS	Integrated Child Protection Scheme
IGNOU	Indira Gandhi National Open University
IPC	Indian Penal Code
IRDP	Integrated Rural Development Programme
JFM	Joint Forest Management
KGBV	Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalaya
LBSNAA	Lal Bahadur Shastri National Academy of Administration
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MFP	Minor Forest Produce
MGNREGA	Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act
MHA	Ministry of Home Affairs
NABARD	National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development
NCPCR	National Commission for Protection of Child Rights

00

Ø

 \bigcirc

NCRB	National Crime Records Bureau
NGO	Non-Government Organization
NFHS	National family Health Survey
NHRC	National Human Rights Commission
NRHM	National Rural Health Mission
PCPNDT	Pre-Conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Technique
POCSO	Protection of Children from Sexual Offences
PRI	Panchayat Raj Institution
PSR	Population Sex Ratio
RBI	Reserve Bank of India
SRB	Sex Ratio at Birth
SSA	Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan
TRYSEM	Training of Rural Youth for Self-Employment
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNECOSOC	United Nations Economic and Social Council
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crimes
WID	Women In Development
WIFS	Weekly Iron Folic Acid Supplementation





0

Day One



Speech of the Chairperson of the Opening Session

Session Introduction

Taking a philosophical route Mr. Padamvir Singh in his opening remarks discussed gender from the larger perspective of imbalances and inequalities that exist in the society. In his address he tried to put forward the case that it is not just the question of addressing gender inequality but it is also a question of addressing the very principle and idea of inequality.

Session Highlights

- The whole discourse around gender needs to be firmly placed and viewed from an overall social dynamics perspective as it also represents the shared values expressed in the Constitution of India
- The key values of liberty and equality that seem to be guiding the Indian society are at the heart of the Constitution. These values are not only in terms of equality between genders but also equality across society
- While India is the land of monism and there exists is no dualism in the Indian *Vedantic* thought (that every part of human life is made up of that ultimate human reality which is the truth and it pervades everything), somehow it has evolved as an extremely divisive kind of a society
- This divisiveness affects all aspects of life whether it is gender, caste system,

religion, communities, region, languages, and so on. This has resulted into a situation where one segment of the society exploits the other. Gender therefore forms part of the overall view of life which the country has gotten into and is not really the Indian heritage

- Western thoughts and ideas are also divisive, for example the concept of the left and the right brain. Eastern traditions on the other hand are far more unifying. For example the Yin and the Yang principles in a sense are complementary even the symbols are complementary
- What happens in a divisive environment is that the society leads to ideas of tolerance and acceptance
- One of the institutions that contributed to this divide is marriage as the man owing to his role of being the bread earner became more powerful. Since woman is at home cooking food and taking care of the house/ family, man (going out to earn) assumed the position of economic superiority, which in turn led to an unequal relationship
- Connected to this is another problem of inadequacy that human beings generally suffer from and men suffer more than women. A deep sense of insecurity is built into our system and men feel more insecure which leads to this drive and desire for more and more power. This desire for power over others gets

66

It is not just a question of addressing gender inequality but it is also a question of addressing the very principle and idea of inequality

manifested in many forms like hierarchical feudal society, gender inequality, etc.

- It is actually the insecurity of human beings that leads to the drive for always trying to be on a higher pedestal and desire for assertiveness over others. If one can get over this insecurity then it would be easier to imbibe the values clearly set in the Indian Constitution
- It is not just the question of addressing gender inequality but also a question of addressing the very idea of inequality. A man cannot feel equal to a woman if he cannot feel equal to another human being. It does not work in half measures that one can try and be equal to women but continue to remain absolutely hierarchical to the rest of the society
- Even if one tries to maintain this pretention of being gender sensitive or neutral, in society s/he will still continue behave in an unequal fashion. The question is larger than just the equality between men and women. There is this issue of transgenders who are completely out of the very discourse on gender
- The issue is slightly more philosophical and slightly larger; therefore it has to be confronted in a deeper sense rather than in a mechanical way of doing things. The change must bring with oneself however

the problem is a difficult and a deep historical one

When compared with other South Asian countries, the situation in India is worse which could be attributed to the caste system due to which we are more divisive in the basic thinking processes especially when compared with the neighbouring countries

Summing-up

The Director reiterated the need for giving up the sense of insecurities that engulf us and leads one to this excessive drive of asserting power over others. He concluded his remarks by wishing everyone a successful training program and left with a Buddhist thought that "essentially you are a hollow bamboo", i.e. the philosophy of *'shunyata'* or nothingness

Ms. Ranjana Kale thanked the director for giving a more philosophical perspective to the entire discourse on gender. Summing-up the session she highlighted that one needs to understand that probably it may have begun by insecurities and all that but we have built so many structures and processes around these insecurities that we have simply become creatures of these very strong structures and processes. The whole debate today is how one can emerge out of these institutional structures and is able to go back to what the nature dictates. Introducing the training program she informed that the five day schedule tries to cover different aspects of gender inequality and child rights. The training sessions are well supported by reading materials, which has been provided to the participants in a pen drive. She once again thanked the director for putting the whole thing in a very philosophical perspective and invited the participants for a group photograph.



Session 1 Understanding Gender and Development

Sarojini Ganju Thakur

Session Introduction

The speaker started where the earlier speaker left off by stating upfront that 'in order to change practice in gender it has to start from within'. She reiterated that gender needs to be considered as a matter of social justice. Therefore the focus of the course is also to view gender from a rights lens. The course would help participants reflect what they can do in their personal lives and respective organizations so as to bring about a positive change with equality.

The purpose of the first session was to being all participants on the same platform which would help them gain clarity on what gender is, what concepts are there regarding gender and development, and the concept of gender equality.

Session Highlights

- India is signatory to various international instruments and rights based documents and therefore it is an obligation (no longer an option) of the state to strive towards gender equality
- An open discussion on the concept of gender helped develop a common understanding that "gender" refers to the socially constructed roles ascribed to males and females, whereas "sex" is biological distinction between males and

females and is determined with reference to genetic and anatomical characteristics

- Like the speaker in the opening session had remarked that gender is only one form of inequality and gender cannot be looked in isolation. Similarly the speaker also clarified that gender is not just about women and men but it cuts across other things as well
- Gender is an aspect of social inequality, is inescapable and cuts across caste, class, ethnicity, etc. Gender defines roles and responsibilities, dress code, mobility, behaviour, rights, opportunities, objects and jobs. It is also much more difficult to deal with in some ways. Even there is a pressure on men to become breadwinners
- Family is the basic unit where gender relations begin to be formed. Within the family women's contribution remains by and large invisible. This invisibility is partially because of the fact that household head is usually a man and her work (cooking, cleaning, etc.) is not recognized. Kaynes ¹ summed this up quite beautifully when he said "as long as this woman used to clean and cook and I was paying her wages she was forming

¹ John Maynard Kaynes (pronounced Canes) was a famous British Economist who in 1930s spearheaded a revolution in economic thinking

66

Financing Women is **Smart Economics**

- World Bank

part of the GDP, the moment I got married to her she was out of the reckoning"

- Gender defines what you do, where you go, what is acceptable and so on. Even space is gendered, for example it is considered unsafe for women in Delhi to work at night; kitchen is considered women's space, whereas *baithak* is man's space
- To further explain 'gendered space' and 'gendered jobs' the speaker facilitated a participatory exercise where she would call names of occupations and activities and participants would have to take positions whether it relates to women or men. While females got associated with professions like nurse, teacher, etc.; men got easily identified with professions like politicians, chef, tailor, doctor, etc. Similarly for activities men were associated with the one who plants vegetables and women with the one who fetches water
- What it means is that the moment a profession or an activity involves economic rewards it becomes man's activity which clearly defines society's perception and gender stereotyping
- Gender further manifests itself into son preference, discrimination in food distribution, lack of education for girls (if there is money for one child's education then usually boy child is preferred), lack of mobility, lack of right to property, lack of participation in decision making, etc.

- 'Gender Equality' can be divided into two forms – (a) formal equality, which means that women can apply but opportunities leading to their becoming eligible to apply are limited; and (b) substantive equality, which creates conditions to remove obstacles and structural barriers to result in equality of opportunities and access and address difference and discrimination (example creating opportunities for girls to pursue higher education)
- Gender equality is a human rights issue and linked to economic growth. Equality in education of women reduces fertility, increases labour market participation, increases growth, increases savings due to wage equality, increases efficiency and productivity, etc.
- Screening of a short film titled 'the girl effect'



While there has been improvement in the situation of women on indicators such as education (particularly primary education), life expectancy, political representation at local level, reduction in maternal and infant mortality rates; gender inequality is still persistent. It is reflected in adverse sex ratio, unequal access to resources and opportunities, difference in voice, etc.

- 'Gender Relations' is intertwined with other forms of gender inequalities and reflects how biological difference becomes socially constructed as social difference. The concept extends the analysis from women and men as isolatable categories to the broader interconnecting relationships through which women are positioned as subordinate group in the division of resources and responsibilities, attributes and capabilities, power and privilege
- 'Gender Needs' can be divided into two 0 forms - (a) practical gender needs which refers to interventions that are aimed at drudgery reduction within socially accepted roles without attempting to modify gender inequalities empowering women; bv and (b) strategic gender needs which refers to interventions that redistribute resources and empower women
- Gender Mainstreaming as per the 1997 0 definition of the United Nation Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) is 'the process of assessing the implication for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies and programmes in all areas and at all levels. It is a strategy for making women as well as men's concerns and experiences an integral dimension of design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation so that women and men benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated. The ultimate goal is to achieve gender equality
- Gender Inequality Index (GII) is applied for measuring gender inequality on indicators such as health, empowerment and labour/ work participation. However GII suffers from some limitations such as parliamentary representation at national level, labour market lacks information on

informal sector/ unpaid work/ time use, asset ownership

- Gender Development Index (GDI) uses same dimensions as Human Development Index (HDI), i.e. life expectancy, education and income and therefore is more of a reflection on the standard of living
- Gender Empowerment Measure (GEM) looks at economic and political participation and control over assets/ economic resources

Q&A Session

- Responding to a question the speaker 0 that 186 countries informed have adopted the Convention the on Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). In India however there are some limitations, first there is no uniform civil code and therefore we would not interfere with religious practices and traditions; and second the registration of marriage is not compulsory
- Every four years each member country has to submit a report to the international community regarding progress made on CEDAW. The civil society also prepares and presents an Alternate Report to CEDAW Report. The CEDAW committee considers both the reports and takes a combined view
- Participants also discussed the situation where women themselves become part of this gender stereotyping. For example there could be some senior female boss who are very allowing, while there could be others who are not kind. Another example is of mother-in-laws in northern India where since she has never exercised power therefore she tends to exercise power over daughter-in-law



• The participants also discussed the need of ensuring that education reaches everyone as well as the importance of having women role models who have broken the stereotypes

Summing up

- Gender issues are a real concern in Indian society and holds greater relevance for civil servants as they can be agents of social change
- The purpose of this whole discourse around gender in this course is to ensure that gender concerns are included in all development interventions
- Awareness on gender can influence behavior and attitude which in turn would bring about a positive influence in both personal and professional life
- It would also help in realization of full potential of both men and women and promote millennium development goal (MDG) of gender equality and empowerment of women
- Gender inequality holds back the growth of individuals, the development of nations and the evolution of societies to the disadvantage of both men and women
- Gender issues are not simply talking about women issues, understanding gender means understanding opportunities, constraints and the impact



of change as they affect both men and women

- Ms. Thakur drawing the session to a closure left the participants with a question that would be discussed at length during the last session of the day "Reflect on your life and your own experiences and define what does being equal mean to you?"
- Screening of a short film titled 'think equal'

Session 1 Child Rights

Enakshi Ganguly

Session Introduction

The purpose of the session was to develop an understanding that development needs to be viewed from a child rights lens.

Session Highlights

- The session started with Ms. Ganguly asking the participants why is it important to discuss children's rights. The participant's responded by saying that children are the future, they need our help, it is an investment, they are tender/ weak/ vulnerable, they are change agents, they do not take their own decisions, they do not write their own destiny, and so on. Ms. Ganguly responded by asking why we look at children as future, do we not need to invest on them as citizens now
- The speaker posed a question before the participants "as a state do we really listen to children"? She explained by saying that we do not and that one of the factors contributing to the continuous abuse of children is also the fact that we do not listen to children
- If one is to recognize children as change agents then it is directly related to how they can express themselves. They cannot be change agents if they are not allowed to express themselves.

- UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), which India ratified in 1992, arrived at the age of 18 years to accommodate all levels of brain development
- The architects of the Indian Constitution 0 had clearly recognized that children and women needed to be addressed separately because of their particularly marginalized situation. Accordingly Article 15 allows for special laws for women and children. Constitution has also clearly addressed the issue of citizenship that 'children are citizens now/ today'. They are entitled to all the rights under the constitution from the day they are born
- Realization of the rights is also about governance. This can be done in two ways: first are the special interventions in forms of laws, policies, schemes, etc.; and second is to move away from the vertical lens of viewing children and about a more holistic view by looking at the development from a child's perspective, i.e. like we have a gender lens similarly there is a need to view things from a child's perspective

66

The non-discrimination principle, the right of the child to be heard principle and the best interests of the child principle needs to be looked together

- To better explain the concept Ms. Ganguly quoted an example of agricultural policy

 that is when one looks at agricultural policy one would question what has it got to do with children but suppose the father dies (e.g. farmers suicide) then child becomes an orphan, and such a child is more likely to dropout and end up joining the work force. Similarly is the case with children affected by migration
- The society has by and large looked upon children as someone to be nurtured and looked after. For the first time in the 11th Five Year Plan there was a separate section on children. It very clearly mentioned that while special interventions have to be made for children, larger development issues, programmes policies and of the government have to be measured with a child rights lens also. The 12th Five Year Plan has reiterated this commitment.
- Any discussion on child rights would have to adhere to the human rights principle. One of the fundamental human rights principles is indivisibility of rights, i.e. one cannot say that the right to education is not linked to the right to health and so on
- There are three fundamental principles that one needs to look at when one talks about child rights – one is best interest principle; the second is non-

discrimination; and the third principle is the right of the child to be heard

- Best Interest Principle states that the best 0 interest of the child would be determined by taking into consideration all aspects. Responding to a question raised by the participants that it would also depend on the personal law, Ms. Ganguly quoted a recent Karnataka High Court ruling where a child had been married under age and the parents of the child asserted that as the marriage is under Islamic law therefore marriage should subsist. The Court however ruled that in the best interest of the child the Prohibition of Child Marriage Act should prevail thereby overriding the Personal law
- Both international and national laws specifically uphold that children have a say in charting their own destiny. The operating principle is "children's right to be heard". The National Plan of Action, Planning Commission, Laws and Judiciary are all operating on the principle of child's right to be heard. Some of the recent examples are that of Goa Children's Act and the states of Kerala and Karnataka which have passed orders and now children are being given space in the gram sabhas (village assembly)
- The non-discrimination principle, the right of the child to be heard and the best interests of the child principle need to be looked together
- There are two types of interventions in governance – one is overall and then there are special interventions. In 2005 Ministry of Women and Children was especially created, the National Policy for Children was first drafted in 1974 and has since been revised and the 2013 policy document is now available, the 11th and 12th Five Year Plan documents for the first time introduced a chapter on child

rights. At the moment there are 58 laws specifically for children, 18 legal provisions in the ICRPC and the Evidence Act, and 88 budgeted schemes and programmes in fourteen ministries

- Prominent laws related to children 0 include (a) Juvenile Justice Act 2000, which deals with children in need of care and protection and children in conflict with law (the government has taken a welfare approach to JJ Act as against a criminal approach); (b) Right to Education Act 2009 where right to education became a fundamental right; the biggest limitation is that deals with children only up to 14 years of age; (c) Child Labour Act which at the present is applicable for children up to 14 years and is being raised to 18 years; (d) Child Marriage Prohibition Act 2006; (e) Pre Conception and Pre Natal Diagnostic Techniques (Prohibition of Sex selection) Act (PCPNDT) 1994 to address falling sex ratio; and (f) Protection of Children from Sexual Offences (POCSO) Act 2012, which looks at sexual offences against children beyond rape
- The key schemes include Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS), Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA), and the new scheme Integrated Child Protection Scheme (ICPS)
- There are, however, still gaps to be addressed which include gaps in understanding, accepting children as right holders, and finally gaps in implementation
- The key challenges faced in the process are that it would take time before the society as a whole agrees to openly discuss issues of children's rights. Further one also needs to challenge the notion that if families are empowered children would be automatically empowered.

Therefore there is definitely a need for special interventions for children

• Gradually progress is being made (Ms. Ganguly shared examples of HAQs work in West Bengal) and there is a growing acceptance in the government. However this acceptance needs to be at all levels and that is how the implementation would improve

Open Discussions & Summing-up

- One of the participants shared a case from West Bengal where an early child marriage was prevented due to the timely intervention of the Superintendent of Police
- The participants also discussed Personal Laws, which allow marriage before 18 years
- The participants also raised the issue of age discrepancies in different laws. It was explained that the issue is now being corrected through legislation
- The participants also raised the issue of gap in the Law with regards to the term 'labour'
- The participants also raised the problem related to lack of infrastructure to safeguard the rights and best interests of a rescued child
- The participants also agreed that there is a need to look at 'standards of care'



Session 2 Gender Inequalities: Using an Institutional Approach

Sarojini Ganju Thakur

Session Introduction

The participants were organized into four groups and each group entrusted with one theme to discuss and identify some of the practices not only from a cultural perspective but also try and identify what are the normative basis that perpetuate these inequalities. There are four major institutions where relationships develop and accordingly these four were identified as themes for the group work (a) gender inequality in family, (b) gender inequality in community, (c) gender inequality in markets, and (d) gender inequality in state. Each group was given about 20 minutes for the group work and was asked to identify one rapporteur in each group who would also make the presentation on behalf of the group.

Group Presentations²



The **first group** (Gender Inequalities in Households/ Families) identified some of the

following practices that perpetuate inequalities at the household level:

- Pre-birth determination of sex/ female feticide/ female infanticide at birth
- Celebrations on the birth of male child
- Biases in allocation of resources especially food, clothing, etc.
- Preference given to boys especially in case of higher education
- Restrictions on girl child
- Early age marriage (before 18 years)
- Denial in property inheritance
- Widow re-marriage not accepted

The participants appreciated that the group in their presentation had covered a whole gamut of issues and during the discussions that followed Ms. Thakur drew participant's attention towards the practice of concentration of resources (knowledge, material, etc.) towards the male members within the family. The result is that the power is concentrated in the hands of male members and it is well established that people who control resources control power. She also expressed that while family is usually considered as an altruistic model, noted economist Amartya Sen had referred to family as a sign of cooperative conflict where there is conflict over resources, dominance, decision making, etc.

The **second group** (Gender Inequalities in Community) identified practices such as:

² For more details refer Annexure



- All marriages are conducted by male members be it priests/ bishops/ maulvis/ etc. and also all rituals are generally performed by male members
- Widows are generally discriminated in all religious and social functions



- Females are more amenable to pressures especially when it comes to marriage
- Preferential treatment given to grooms family during marriage and the financial burden is on the bride's family
- Segregation of males and females during all important social functions
- Insignificant representation in community decision making (for example development works in the local areas are decided by men
- Discrimination of females in access to educational (particularly in higher education) and job opportunities on the plea of security
- Discrimination of females in property rights especially in inheritance of ancestral property
- Polygamy is more prevalent than polyandry

During the discussions that followed Ms. Thakur pointed out that during the presentation some very important points emerged and a very strong point was made about religion. It is only recently that in some religions women are allowed to become priests. Control over lot of institutions (for example *khap panchayats* or other traditional community forms of organizations) still rests in the hands of male members. Community plays a role in perpetuating gender inequalities. Witch hunting is another example of how communities try and exercise control over women and perpetuate inequalities. Many of these practices gradually become the accepted social norms of the community.



The **third group** (Gender Inequalities in Market) identified practices by studying the markets under two categories – organized and unorganized.

- unorganized markets 0 In several inequitable practices exist in ownership of resources, working hours (working hours at home are completely unaccounted for), wage distribution, access to technology and design of technology, entrepreneurship opportunities (access to finance is denied to women), etc.
- In organized markets several inequitable practices exist in form of stereotyping of jobs (examples shared from several industries and how certain jobs are assigned to women only). The group also discussed how gender interacting with other vulnerabilities makes the woman more vulnerable



During the discussions that followed Ms. Thakur pointed out how some of the inequalities that one saw in family are reproduced in the market. For example jobs in nursing and primary school teaching are all based on society's perception about the nurturing quality of women. The second important this the invisibility of women's work, i.e. any work which is non-productive becomes invisible. The whole concept of nine to five job is based on stereotyping of women. The presentation also brought out the linkages between inequalities, hierarchy of jobs and the nature of skill up gradation – trainings are invariably given to men.



The **fourth group** (Gender Inequalities in State) identified practices such as:

- Very poor representation of females in high courts, administration and bureaucracy
- Whenever there is a preference for field posting the government decision is usually in favour of male officers
- While there are lady teachers but the key positions like principal, vice chancellor are largely led by males
- In the Public Distribution System (PDS) male is identified as the head of the household
- Distribution of government funds is generally done through tender process and by and large females don't participate in this process

- Male HH head plays a key role in accessing MGNREGA work
- In health department key posts are held by males, in railways ticket examiners, drivers are mainly males, in forest 10% forest guards females in some states, in police department constabulary, SI and Para Military Forces are mostly males

During the discussions that followed Ms. Thakur pointed out inequality is deeply entrenched for example on every form name of father or husband is required, in government offices not much concern is paid towards constructing toilets for women, etc. Therefore in a way the state also reproduces many of the biases that come from the society. In IAS till 1956 there was a rule that if a woman got married and the family duty interfered with the professional duty then she can be removed. However, there have been pioneering women who have broken the stereotyped - for example reduction of physical test in Indian Forest Service and Indian Police Service (different for women and men). The state therefore should have been thinking about equal representation for men and women.

Summing-up

Legislation only enables and does not bring about change in itself if the attitudes and practices do not change. Summing up the discussions, Ms. Thakur expressed that gender inequality across India is not the same. In societies where the farming system is dependent on women and/or where women are involved in trading activity their status tends to be higher. In the north India while women have a role in farming activities, they don't work for wages and therefore it is not looked as productive labour. On the contrary, in Andhra Pradesh



women have some control over money as they work for agriculture wage labour.

In terms of marriage practices there are states like Kerala, Tamil Nadu, Karnataka, etc. where girls are getting married within the same families it is generally believed that since they are married within family the level of domestic violence is less. Generally most of the extreme cases around dowry are more in north India where girls are usually married outside *gotra* and in different villages as a result it becomes difficult to seek support. However, as far as property rights are concerned very few women have properties in their name.

In short gender inequalities vary across regions, are linked to the farming systems, distribution of resources and so on. Then there is also the issue of multiple deprivations with the way gender interacts with other vulnerabilities. Concentration of resources in the hands of men and perpetuation of social norms are significant deterrents in achieving gender equality. φ¹

Joint Training Program on Gender and Child Rights



Session 3 Gender and Development

Sarojini Ganju Thakur

Session Introduction

The session started by sharing a case study for participants to reflect how the planners planned for the scheme. The case study was about a situation where the government introduced a scheme for landless peasants to enhance their income by introducing rice as a cash crop. The participants were expected to give their opinion regarding the objective of the scheme and whether providing land and introducing rice as a cash crop likely to improve the welfare of the people/ beneficiaries of the scheme. The participants, for this purpose, were organized into four working groups.

Discussions on Case Study

- The objective of the scheme was to give land to landless peasants and introduce cash crop to improve the welfare of the families. The participants felt that as far as raising income was concerned the scheme probably might have had positive impact but as far as overall welfare of the family is concerned it would not have been improved by introducing this scheme
- The planners did not looked into the existing situation and instead lot of assumptions were made during planning regarding how women and men operate. For example these were polygamous families and were given two rooms

- In the previous system the peasants were not rice eating community and the women had control over land. The planner has not taken into account the existing situation and cultural pattern and treated the man as the head of the household and thereby totally violated the rights and welfare of the women
- The second issue, linked to the above point, is that also of the nutritional security. The issue is that when women gain access to household income they use the money for household, education and for the family, while men can have many more other uses. In the case study women used to cultivate maize and wheat and had control over the family plot. In the present arrangement since they no longer can exercise this control there could also arise an issue of nutritional security as the income from land will now go directly in the hands of male members

The important **lessons learned** through the case analysis can be summarized as below:

• While planning it is important to consider what assumptions are being made regarding men and women. It is important to be aware of the existing situation because the effects of one's action can have unforeseen negative effects on men and women

- Increase in income does not necessarily increase the welfare of the people, i.e. it does not automatically trickle down
- One of the participants shared the examples of women milk cooperatives and water management committees, which brought income in the hands of women. When women have control over property and resources it also brings down cases of domestic violence

Approaches to Gender & Development

- The first type of approach is 'gender blind' where the planning process is completely dominated by men, i.e. it is planning by men, for men and of men. In such a scenario the role of women becomes completely invisible
- The second type of planning is 'gender aware' planning where the planners are aware about the roles that men and women play and they take into account the difference
- The third type is called 'gender neutral' where the planners don't do anything to drastically change the role played by men and women
- The fourth type is 'gender specific', which is focused only on women and does not look at women in relation to men. It is a scenario where women are considered to be deprived and there is a need to have projects which specifically addresses women's needs. For example the Development of Women and Children in Rural Areas (DWCRA) scheme
- The last and the most empowering type of approach is 'gender redistributive' where planners build-in something in the project or program that increases/ improves the position of women. For example access to finance, i.e. in rural areas women are quite inhibited by the formal financial Institutions, now if one

wishes to change this situation then what is needed is an intervention that improves their access to finance without being overly dependent on banks. Such an approach enhances the capacity of women to have a say in their own development process

• To summarize it is important to adopt an approach to planning where women have voice, they participate in the planning process, they are heard, and there is a definite impact on the way resources are allocated

History of Gender & Development

- Initially women had only two roles they could either be mothers [good woman] or bad woman. This continued through 1950s to 1970s and as a consequence all interventions were either for the welfare or protection of women.
- 0 In 1970s, partially because of international influences, there was a work towards equality. This was a time when Towards Equality Report and Shram Shakti Reports were tabled and started viewing women as 'producers'. Basically planners started looking at women as workers and as a result women got added in the development discourse. This resulted in introducing schemes like distribution of sewing machines, cows, etc. and women earned the recognition that they are also contributors to the economy. However, there still existed stereotyping and it was still about women and not gender per se.
- 1980s onward there was a shift towards rights based approaches and that women can determine their own future
- In Constitution of India Article 14, 15(3), 39, 42, 51A, etc. are important for women as they enables the state to make special provisions for women

CEDAW defines discrimination against women as "any distinction, exclusion or restriction made on the basis of sex which has the effect or purpose of impairing or nullifying the recognition, enjoyment or exercise by women, irrespective of their marital status, on a basis of equality of men and women, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural, civil or any other field"

- In 1985, the Government of India established a separate department for the welfare of women, which in 2006 became an independent Ministry of Women and Child Development. This was also the period when DWCRA got introduced.
- In the year 1994, the 73rd and the 74th Amendments to the Constitution of India ushered in the era of empowerment of women through participation in local self-governance, microfinance, and formation of self-help groups
- In 2001, the first ever National Empowerment Policy for Women was introduced
- In the international arena women gained recognition in the development debate which is evident through the following milestones:
 - 1972 was declared as the 'International Year of the Woman'
 - 1975-1985 was the United Nations Decade for Women

- In 1984 forward looking strategies for women were discussed in Nairobi
- In 1995, the China-Beijing Platform for Action focusing on gender mainstreaming proved to be an important turning point which shifted the focus from women to gender
- The Convention to Eliminate all forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), an international bill of rights for women (1979), was signed by 186 countries and India is also a signatory with certain reservations.
- CEDAW is an important bill for women and in the Vishakha Judgement the Judge had quoted CEDAW to pass the landmark judgement on sexual harassment at workplace
- Introduction of Gender Development Index (GDI), Gender Empowerment Measure (GEM) in human development measure and the introduction of Millennium Development Goals where six out of eight goals relate to gender
- The Gender Inequality Index (GII) introduced for measurement of gender disparity and looks at labour market, reproductive health, and empowerment
- The OECD and UNICEF introduced Gender Equality Policy Marker as a tool for mainstreaming gender in programmes
- The speaker shared an example of Sweden where every program is assessed for gender equality
- Gender in India's Five Year Plan documents
 - Sixth Plan: Separate chapter on women
 - Seventh Plan: 27 major women specific schemes



- Ninth Plan: 30% women's component programme
- Tenth Plan: commitment to gender budgeting
- Eleventh and Twelfth Plan: reinforced commitment
- The speaker also explained the difference between Gender and Development (GAD) and Women in Development (WID). While in GAD women are seen as active, in WID women are viewed to be passive, and an isolated category. It is often a problem of planners prejudice and assumptions regarding the roles and responsibilities of women.
- In development there are several approaches to gender such as welfaristic approach (example – programmes in the area of health, education, etc.), antipoverty approach of 1970s and 1980s, efficiency approach that recognizes increasing women's capacity will also improve productivity, equity approach, and empowerment approach which believes that women need to have the control over resources and have the power to take their own decisions

Summing-up

Concluding the session, the speaker said that the purpose of the session was to awaken gender lens and stressed that whatever work one does in day-to-day lives one needs to look it through this lens.

Ø



Day Two



Session 4 Breaking Social Norms I: Addressing Adverse Child Sex Ratio

Rizwan Parvez

Session Introduction

Ms. Thakur introducing the session informed that both sex ratio and the declining sex ratio are linked with the issue of survival of the girl child. Therefore it is a gender issue, rights issue and children's issue. The session started with the speaker stating that the presentation is in line with issues related to gender, survival and constitutional rights of girl child covered during the previous sessions. He highlighted the issue of decline in the number of girls in the country. He briefed that the session is organized into six parts - data on child sex ratio, determinants, methods of sex selection, consequences of sex selection, practices, recommendations on how to address the issue within the legal framework of Pre-Conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques (PCPNDT) Act, 1994.

What the data says

- In India sex ratio is calculated at three levels, i.e. Sex Ratio at Birth (SRB), Child Sex Ratio (CSR) and Population Sex Ratio (PSR)/ total sex ratio.
- He informed that globally sex ratios are calculated as males for every 100 females or boys for every 100 girls when considering CSR/ SRB. In India these ratios are calculated as females per 1000 males or girls for every 1000 boys. Therefore in India the reference to a declining sex ratio refers to an adverse

sex ratio. The international equivalent for CSR is 109 and for SRB it is 110. SRB is available under Sample Registration System (SRS) and CSR/ PSR is available under Census of India

- In India overall the total sex ratio has improved. However, according to the Census data the sex ratio has declined during last four decades in the 0-6 age group, i.e. from 962 in 1981 to 919 in 2011. The highest CSR is in Chhattisgarh (969) and lowest is in Haryana (834)
- Reflecting on the state-wise decline in the child sex ratio between 2001 and 2011 the speaker informed that while the north eastern region is the better performing in the country, the epicentre of the problem is in the North West. The following significant facts were highlighted during the presentation:
 - Out of the 10 worst performing districts in the country, 8 are from Haryana and J&K
 - Except Himachal Pradesh, no state in the north-west region has a child sex ratio above 900
 - while Punjab (+48) and Haryana (+15) have witnessed an increase in the child sex ratio, both the states are still far from the national average and are still considered among the top five worst performing states

66

Punjab, Haryana, Rajasthan, Delhi, Himachal Pradesh and J&K are in the category of ten worst performing states on child sex ratio indicator

- Punjab, Haryana, Rajasthan, Delhi, Himachal Pradesh and J&K are in the category of ten worst performing states in the country. J&K has experienced maximum drop of 79 points in its child sex ratio.
- The speaker discussed at the length the various reasons responsible for the decline in the child sex ratio
 - Son preference across all regions, communities and religions
 - Literacy combined with prosperity has an impact on CSR
 - Good female work participation leads to improved CSR
 - Misuse of technology impacts CSR
 - Low fertility impacts CSR
 - While in rural CSR has declined, problem is quite severe in urban
- Punjab has showed major improvements in CSR. One of the participants informed that the political will combined with the stringent implementation of PCPNDT Act in the state could have contributed in improving the CSR. Another noteworthy fact is that this improvement was witnessed not only in Punjab but also in the regions bordering the state
- Reflecting on the situation J&K the speaker informed that the PCPNDT Act has not been taken seriously in the state and there were also problems with the Census 2001 data and it is generally

believed by demographers that the situation could have been equally poor in 2001 as well

Determinants, Methods, Consequences & Insights Gained

- Son Preference is one of the major contributors in declining child sex ratio. This in turn is governed by a number of factors such as:
 - Social: Old age support, family name, low status of women, social security, dowry
 - Economic: Family Income, liability, women workforce participation
 - Cultural: Patriarchy, family norm , tradition, prestige
 - Religious: Funerary rituals, last rite
 - Policies and laws: Two-child norm, decline in fertility, female workforce participation, dowry act, inheritance law, property rights, domestic violence act, etc.
- A number of methods are used to support this sun preference, such as:
 - Pre-conception methods
 - Sex selective insemination after sperm sorting
 - Pre-implantation methods
 - Sex selective embryo transfer
 - Pregnancy methods
 - Sex determination and subsequent sex selective elimination (since 1980)
 - Foetal DNA in maternal blood (new technology)
 - Post Birth methods include infanticide (female infanticide reported in the past to avoid female births), abandonment, etc.
- Earlier infanticide was often confused with early neonatal mortality. Excess girl child mortality is caused by neglect and male child preference in access to

medical care and nutrition. Under five mortality among girls is high.

- This sex imbalance leads to a number of problems, such as:
 - Increase in violence against women for example abduction for marriage, honour killings, etc.
 - Trafficking of women and girls
 - Marriage squeeze excess bachelors in India
 - Poor treatment/exclusion of crossregion brides
 - Wife sharing by unmarried brothers
 - Devaluation of women
- The speaker shared a Photo Essay prepared by Ruhani and few case studies to highlight the complex nature of the problem
- The speaker summarized the session by drawing the following inferences:
 - Patriarchy prevails in Indian society and the decline in CSR is a manifestation of this patriarchy
 - Need to challenge patriarchy by ensuring women's access to equal citizenship rights and its manifestations in policies and programmes
 - Policy should aim at increasing women's access to employment and education
 - Violence against women for bearing girl child is rampant but usually unreported
 - It is important to address all aspects of declining child sex ratio.
 - Neo-natal, post neo-natal and under five mortality among girls is throughout high despite health care services
 - Code of Medical Ethics needs to be promoted among medical associations

- It is important to break denial about many issues, including practice of sex determination, facts and figures

Recommendations

- Prevent misuse of medical technology for sex selection
- Evaluate conditional cash incentive and other schemes. Plan schematic interventions for BPL as well as middle and high income families
- Review gender-related laws, policies and programmes including dowry law, proposed amendments to laws related to rape
- Develop comprehensive communication and advocacy strategy for behaviour change (UNFPA is working on the communication strategy)

Addressing Adverse Sex Ratio at Birth Legally

- Ban on pre-natal sex selection was first imposed in 1988 in Maharashtra. Later in 1994, the Maharashtra PNDT Act was enacted for the whole country which made provisions for
 - Prohibition on prenatal sex determination
 - Prohibition on advertisement relating to sex determination/ selection services
 - Registration of clinics offering preconception and pre-natal services
- This Act was further amended in 2001 0 and 2003 to include pre-conception techniques. Central and state-level supervisory boards have been constituted and more stringent punishments have been defined for the offenders. Appropriate Authorities have been given civil court power
- However when it comes to any law, it is not just about rules and sections but also about self-regulation, public education,

and state's readiness to enforce the law. Till 2001, no state had actually acted on the implementation of the law and shown willingness to regulate its sex determination. Punjab and Haryana responded in early 2002 and sustained the process of implementation with the help of NGO representatives and media. Rajasthan, with the support from civil society groups, set up its mechanism by 2007 but acted only in early 2009. In Delhi no serious effort were undertaken to fix accountability. Maharashtra is the only state in the country which has acted seriously on the provisions of this act

- Maharashtra, Punjab, Rajasthan and Gujarat are the four states with highest number of cases registered. Registration of doctors with ultrasound centres has been challenged by some doctors. Maharashtra has the highest number of registered centres. The Government of Rajasthan advertised in the newspapers appealing all doctors to register the ultrasound machines even if they were unregistered earlier and promised no action will be taken against them if they do so.
- Discussing the forms that the ultrasound centres have to provide to the government, the participants advocated in favour of making the Form-F stringent
- The speaker also shared a number of recent gazette notifications that have been issued by the government:
 - In exercise of the powers conferred under Section-32 of the PCPNDT Act, the Central Government has made amendments in the PCPNDT Rules, 1996
 - Registration of doctors with ultrasound centres: The Gazette Notification dated 4th June 2012 permits a qualified medical

practitioner to conduct sonography at not more than two ultrasound centres within a district. Consulting hours for each practitioner should also be clearly specified

- Use of portable ultrasound machine: According to the Gazette Notification dated 5th February 2012, use of portable ultrasound machines has been partially restricted. No 'standalone' diagnostic centre or mobile van can use portable machine. However, use of portable machine has been permitted from those registered premises which give services to the indoor patients
- Registration fee: The registration fee for an ultrasound clinic has been increased from INR 3,000 to INR 25,000. Similarly registration fee for hospital/nursing home has been raised from INR 4,000 to INR 35,000.
 Some of the participants raised concerns that increasing the fee might actually act as a deterrent for doctors who would like to avoid getting their ultrasound centres registered with the government
- Change of place: Every centre has to inform the Appropriate Authority about a change in place, doctor or equipment at least thirty days in advance and seek re-issuance of certificate of registration from the Appropriate Authority
- Medical Practitioners have raised a number of concerns such as the need to separate minor and major offence and simplify Form 'F'. They have been opposing inspection and sealing of ultrasound machines/ records. They also pretend ignorance about the gazette notifications, rules and provisions of the PCPNDT Act and have opposed state

action under the PCPNDT Act by calling strikes, refusing pre-natal services to pregnant women. The constitutional validity of the PCPNDT Act has also been challenged by medical practioners by filing of writ petitions in various courts of law

- There also exits a number of challenges with regards to the implementing authorities that include transfer of officials which creates an impasse in routine inspection, monitoring and filing of complaints; lack of 'accountability' and 'seriousness', poor execution of circulars at the district level, delay in filing of complaints filing, etc.
- At the level of Civil Society Groups the key challenges that exist include limited reach (i.e. interventions limited to specific regions and specific strategies), no serious attempt to engage with the implementation aspect of the law, and lack of consensus and ideological differences on the approaches to deal with the problem of decline in the child sex ratio
- At the level of Mass Media the key challenges include merging safe and legal abortion issue (Medical Termination of Pregnancy) with the implementation of the PCPNDT Act., wider coverage and publicity on 'abandoned foetus' and frequent use of terminology like 'bhurn hatya'
- At the level of judiciary and lawyers there is lack of sensitivity on the issue and absence of network of lawyers willing to take up the issue and argue on behalf of prosecution/ civil society in the court of law.

Summing up

The discussion that followed helped in one of the participants suggesting that the health functionaries at local level need to focus counselling efforts on pregnancies where the first pregnancy outcome was a girl child or there have been two girl child's in the family. Further it would be helpful to find out all cases of wastage and get the details of centres facilitating it so as to take necessary actions.



Session 5 Breaking Social Norms II: Child Marriage

Dora Giusti

Session Introduction

The session started with a presentation which was organized into four sections – data, determinants, consequences and responses. For the data on child marriage the cohort of 20-24 years is used for analysis in India (i.e. married before 18 years).

Data on Child Marriage

- As per the Progress of Children 2009, there are more than 60 million child brides in South Asia and of this India contributes to about 40 per cent of total child marriages (23 million). What it means is that almost 1 in 2 women in India gets married as a child
- While the child marriage is declining, the rate of decline is very low, i.e. 0.7 per cent per year. Further it is important to note that within India, there are significant geographical disparities. While the rates of child marriage are going down overall and in rural areas, the rates have increased in some urban areas. This could be owing to the migration from poor high child marriage areas to low child marriage urban areas
 - The analysis shows that where patriarchal norms are strong the percentage of child marriage is higher. For example Bihar is the worst performing with more than 80

per cent prevalence in southern districts.

- The overall incidence of child marriage in Tamil Nadu is 24 per cent but for districts that are located on Andhra Pradesh border, the prevalence rate is equal or more than the national average
- In South Delhi the incidence of child marriage, even in rich pockets, is higher than the national average
- Prevalence rate of early girl child marriage is higher than the male child, i.e. girls are twice more likely to get married early than boys. Median age is 16.8 years for girls and 22.6 years for boys. Median age at marriage amongst marginalized social groups is two years lower than other social groups

Determinants of Child Marriage

- Reflecting on the causes, Ms. Giusti explained that a UNICEF and ICRW research in Bihar and Rajasthan in 2011 brought out the following combination of factors responsible for early marriage:
 - **Gender Norms:** There is a strong community perceptions regarding the roles that women are expected to play in the society. Women are seen mainly to have a reproductive and domestic role, and therefore not worth 'investing in' in terms of

66

Even though parents may be aware of the harmful effects of child marriage, they may not be able to resist social pressure to marry their daughters off

> education and other opportunities. There is common belief that a girl is not eligible for a good groom if her marriage is not arranged when she is an adolescent, prompting parents to marry their daughters young

- **Social pressure:** Even though parents may be aware of the harmful effects of child marriage, they may not be able to resist social pressure to marry their daughters off before the legal age of 18 due to fear of exclusion from the community
- **Marriage Practices:** Atta Satta marriage, which is the practice of exchanging a daughter in return for a daughter-in-law in marriage which may involve up to five or six households to ensure the required number of brides and grooms
- Safety of girls: People interviewed responded that it is not safe for girls to be roaming around. Patriarchal values also translate into controlling women's and girls' reproductive and sexual rights. The fear of family dishonour through sexual assault on a daughter who has reached puberty or an elopement often triggers child marriage as a false means to protect the girl's chastity. However this does not match with the sexual violence data which reveals that young girls

are subject to sexual violence within their households

- Financial **Constraints:** Together with prevailing social practices and traditions, а family's financial situation plays a role as to when girls Girls marry. in the poorest households marry as early as 15 vears of age, and at least five years earlier than women in the wealthiest households. There is limited incentive to keep daughters unmarried for long because of the perception that girls are a burden to the household
- **Dowry:** The system of dowry continues to perpetuate child marriage in spite of it being legally prohibited. As the dowry amount increases with the girl's age and education, parents, especially from poorer households, tend to marry their daughters off as children. This also varies from state to state, for example in West Bengal dowry is not a problem but in Rajasthan it is a big reality. Further in some states, due to the high cost of wedding ceremonies, families marry their daughters off in a marriage common ceremony, regardless of age
- Lack of Education: Education is a major deterrent and the statistics reveal that women with ten years or more of education are six times less likely to marry at an early age. Distance from school, absence of teachers, poor infrastructure, and little relevance of education are some of the reasons affecting girls' education
- Low awareness and weak enforcement of laws, policies & programmes: People know that child marriage is illegal, yet they are

unaware of the details regarding 'The Prohibition of Child Marriage Act, 2006' and how to pursue justice and what are its consequences. Convictions are few and far between and the few existing convictions are unknown to the public. Men - who are the ultimate decision makers regarding child marriage - perceive they can overlook the law. The speaker shared examples from West Bengal where villagers chased the police away and on the contrary scenario in Tamil Nadu where the police effectively collaborated with the PRIs to avert child marriage

- Weak enforcement of the Child Marriage Prohibition Act: The District Magistrate/ District Collector depends on information received from frontline workers and since they themselves are members of the local communities therefore they are hesitant to report against their neighbours in the local area. In addition, they often face a dilemma between going against poor families who have indebted themselves to marry their daughters. Further often it is seen that the government officials themselves are not properly oriented on the law. Limited accountability, lack of synergy among sectors and inadequate monitoring systems further add to the problem
- Limitations of cash incentives: Cash incentive programs have limited response as monetary incentives do not outweigh social costs. The research in Rajasthan revealed that while the father looks more at economic side of child marriage, mother finds social pressures as a

more compelling factor for agreeing to child marriage

Consequences of Child Marriage

- Child marriage pushes girls out of school. Drop-out rates seem to be associated with trends in child marriage. It is proven that education can act as a strong deterrent against child marriage as it provides girls with the skills and knowledge to find employment and empowers them to seek alternatives to child marriage
- Early pregnancy leads to higher 0 maternal, infant and child mortality. According to NFHS 2005-06 data, 16 per cent in the age group 15-19 years have begun child bearing. Child marriage is associated with health-related risks for both the mother and baby. Children of young mothers are less healthy. Children under five born to mothers married before 18 years of age run a higher risk of under nutrition. Frequently, these young mothers suffer from poor nutrition themselves. Early childhood mortality is highest among children born to young mothers. More new-borns die to women younger than 20 years old than those between 20 and 39 years old
- The incidence of **sexual violence by husband** is higher among 15-19 years olds.
- Young brides also have difficulty in taking **decisions**

Protective Environment

 Globally there is CRC which was ratified by India in 1992 and the CEDAW which was ratified by India in 1993. In India special legislation was introduced in form of the Child Marriage Restraint Act of 1929, which got amended in 1978 and

then in 2006 Prohibition of Child Marriage Act got introduced.

- While child marriage is not explicitly mentioned in CRC, it is considered as harmful practice
- Protective measurement for guardians and community – punishment for anybody who is involved except women. Provision for two years imprisonment and fine up to one lakh rupees
- Supportive measurement for girls they can nullify the marriage but only within two years of attaining majority. Provision for husband to pay maintenance to girl till her remarriage and legitimacy of any children born out of marriage including custody and maintenance to mother

Limitations

- The problem however is that the conviction rates are very low. Even officials and panchayats find it really hard to implement the law
- There is lot of burden on girl to come forward to declare the marriage null
- Marriage Registration is not compulsory
- Government officials are not punished. Many mass marriages, which government supports, contribute in getting girls below 18 years married

Addressing Child Marriage

- The speaker also discussed other laws and policies that could potentially support addressing child marriage issue
- Several government schemes such as SABLA, ICPS, SSA, KGBV and state schemes such as the *Dhanalakshmi* (cash incentive scheme) and bicycle donation scheme have created enormous impact in Bihar and Rajasthan. However, SABLA is more focused on nutrition aspects than empowerment of adolescent girls.

Summing up

Child marriage is multi-dimensional and therefore requires a multi-sectoral strategy. Linking with other services and working with fathers is a key to addressing this issue. Some other aspects include:

- Social norm issue needs to be addressed by putting in place a community pressure against early age marriage
- There is a need to showcase some convictions (in media) so people get a sense about the legal provisions
- Community policing is very important so that community doesn't see police as an outsider and instead work together
- Developing 'District Action Plans' under the leadership of District Collector where every three months each sector reports progress on the issue of child marriage
- Provision for girl friendly facilities in schools as well as transport facilities for girls
- Sensitizing teachers and School Management Committees
- Changing norms and mind-sets through campaigns tapping on the role of father
- Promote the concept of child marriage free villages – example Rajasthan where government gives certificates to villages for zero child marriages
- Working with PRIs, Caste/ Religious Leaders
- Use of Folk Theatre
- Formation of Child Protection Committees – could be both informal and formal
- Empowerment of girls and creating positive Role Models



Session 6 Child Malnutrition and Government Programmes

Dr. N.C. Saxena

Session Introduction

The session started with Dr. Saxena talking about how some programmes like National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) and road development are working well and how programmes around malnutrition and forestry are not doing so well. He stressed that in addition to the governance issues there are also design and policy related issues.

Session Highlights

- India has a dubious record in child malnutrition. About 40 per cent children are malnourished (i.e. for their age their weight is not up to the mark) and are also stunted, i.e. for their age the height has not increased. In India children have gained height by 1 cm but at the same time in China it has gone up by 4 cm
- Initially malnutrition was perceived as a problem of poverty. In 2005-06 it was realized that despite economic growth the problem has not been addressed. The increased awareness has not translated in policy/ design reforms and improved implementation of programmes
- One of the major problems is that the programme is designed for children in the older age group of 3-6 years but the problem of stunting and underweight in children sets in when the child is the age group of 6 month to 2 years. This is the

most critical age group and once the problem sets in then stunting will remain for life

- The Government of India improved the funding which led to an increase in the number of ICDS centres from 5 lakh in early 2004 to 13 lakh. However about 80 per cent of this increase fund was meant for supplementary nutrition and this also led to lot of corruption in the programme delivery
- Going to the roots of the problem, Dr. Saxena shared that the India's rate of growth was between 3-4 per cent per annum in 1951-52 and increased to around 7 per cent in 2011-12. However, after the 1990s food grain production (grew at a slightly higher rate than the population) has remained almost stagnant
- While the food grain production has not increased, India started exporting and holding food grains as well as the buffer stocks in government go-downs also increased. As a result the per capita availability of food grains started declining after 1991
- The speaker present data which revealed that while the consumption of cereals by the rich is around 14-15 kg, the poor consume only 9-12 kg in rural areas

66

According to the 2012 Global Hunger Index Scores by Severity, India is in the category of alarming hunger

- Hunger is measured as a multi composite indicator of three indices – how many calories one consumes, %age of malnourished children, and the %age of child mortality
- According to the 2012 Global Hunger Index Scores by Severity, India is in the category of alarming hunger. Hunger Index in all countries gone down except India. This is primarily because of malnourished children which are given high weightage
- As a result the progress towards achieving the MDG Goal 1 has slowed down after 1998 and at this rate India might not be able to achieve this MDG target by 2015
- The HUNGaMA Report 2011, analysed data from 100 focus districts from backward states and revealed that stunting is 60 per cent and about 42 per cent children are underweight
- There is no strong correlation between per capita income and underweight children
- The speaker shared that there are large number of factors behind malnutrition
 - Poor sanitation (India contributes about 50 per cent to overall global burden of the open defecation)
 - Poor Quality of Water
 - Early marriage of girls
 - Poor cultural practices where women will not eat unless the whole family has eaten

- Low birth weight babies
- Poor cultural practices regarding exclusive breastfeeding, colostrum feeding and complementary feeding
- High disease burden, particularly malaria and diarrhoea
- Migration
- Mothers who have to go to work have to leave children at home, resulting in poor care and feeding practices
- The problem of under nutrition is most severe in Madhya Pradesh
- The speaker discussed the new Few Security Act introduced by the Government of India in 2013
 - The distribution of food grains under the new Act covers 75 per cent rural and 50 per cent urban population
 - Antodaya households will get 7 kg per unit of rice, wheat and millets and the rest will get 5 kg
 - Legal entitlements for child and maternal nutrition (Pregnant women and lactating mothers to get free meal and six thousand rupees during pregnancy and six months thereafter)
- The speaker discussed with the participants the various design problems that exist in planning and implementation of the ICDS scheme
 - Little emphasis on children below three years of age
 - Pregnant women, lactating mothers, adolescent girls and children below three years are practically invisible at the Anganwadi Centres (AWCs)
 - Many AWCs are functioning in rented or 'donated' rooms, hence in upper caste localities, little benefit to *dalit* children
 - Domestic child care and feeding practices are not monitored

- Despite Supreme Court orders, centralized contracts in many states have encouraged corruption
- Non-convergence of Health & Nutrition Services
- Poor/ lack of infrastructure (building, clean water, toilet, cooking equipment, weighing scales, toys, etc.)
- Low/ lack of community/ panchayat participation
- Too much obsession with food/ supplementary nutrition
- "Тоо much data, too little information" - most figures are unreliable. According to Sachin Pilot "All data of children at the centre. weight, vaccinations, health records etc., were filled in with pencils. On probing further, I found it was done so that in case of an official inspection, the figures could be erased and "correct" data inserted to make the centre's performance look good!"
- Huge gap between reported data and evaluated data available through NFHS 2005-06. According to NFHS III data 18 percent children were severely malnourished. However the ICDS data was reporting 0.5 per cent severely malnourished children
- The speaker stressed that bogus data is not just an ethical problem but also managerial problem. If one wishes to achieve results in nutrition then one must measure it, measure it correctly and incentivize it. Some of the participants shared the pilots conducted in the use of electronic weighing scales where the chances of manipulating data gets minimized
- An evaluation carried out by the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC) in

Gorakhpur district in Uttar Pradesh revealed that:

- 86 per cent budget is spent on procuring ready to eat (RTE) food which only provides 100 calories as against the norm of 300 calories
- RTE is stored in unhygienic condition and about 63 per cent of food and funds are misappropriated
- Half of RTE ends up as cattle feed
- Only 5 out of 35 AWCs visited were running on a regular basis
- Each AWC centre pays INR 2000 per month as bribe to the Supervisor
- In Bihar the ICDS programme was evaluated in 2007 and highlighted that less than 10 per cent of Anganwadi Workers (AWWs) receive honorarium regularly. It also revealed huge vacancies in the position of Supervisors (74 per cent) and CDPOs (63 per cent)
- The speaker shared an example of 0 Thailand where in the 1980s per capita of income was similar to India and 50 per cent children were malnourished. Within 13 years Thailand succeeded in reducing it to 15 per cent. What they did was that a team went from village to village to identify the AWW based on the qualities of being respected in the village, consulted bv pregnant women, willingness to work, etc. No honorarium was paid to the selected worker and all weight measurement was carried out in community settings
- The reasons for poor performance in India could be summarized as below:
 - Stagnant agriculture
 - Low expenditure on social sector
 - Faulty design of ICDS
 - Lack of outcome orientation, poor Monitoring & Evaluation, unreliable data and weak accountability



- Nutrition is multi-sectoral and hence most neglected.
- Poor community participation

Summing up

Concluding the session the speaker reiterated that if the performance is measured then there would be greater accountability. He shared two examples where the AWWs are graded and the other in Tamil Nadu where there are two workers – one for older children and the other for younger children.

India's tax collection is poorest among the BRIC countries and the social sector expenditure is also not very high. Further there is a tendency to invest more funds in immediate relief programmes (example MGNREGA) and less funds in long term relief programmes (example education, health, etc.). The reason is that investing in education, health, etc. would require governance reforms.



Session 7 Gender and Forestry

Dr. N.C. Saxena

Session Introduction

The speaker introducing the session said that patriarchy is deep rooted in the society. While landless labourers can get organized against landlord, *tribals* can take to insurgency, *dalits* can make their own party, the women cannot get organized against their own sons and husbands. The people who are exploiting women most are the ones they love the most. This is the reason why not much has happened towards their empowerment

Session Highlights

- Women participation in work force has declined over the years (34 per cent in 1983 and declined to around 26 per cent in 2011-12). As India is progressing women are getting more and more dependent on men. There could be many reasons that are responsible for this trend:
 - One reason could be that many women in this age group are studying and may have withdrawn from the workforce
 - Another reason could be that there are many kinds of work that they used to perform are no longer available, for example traditionally transplanting and harvesting of paddy was done by women, now this work is done by machines

- Another factor is that the jobs that are being created in the non-farm sector (example - security guard, construction, etc.) are all male oriented
- Further the nature of forest has also changed from the Minor Forest Produce (MFP) orientation to timber orientation. As a result while women used to collect MFP earlier, nowthey find it hard as now one can only find Tendu, Mahua and timber
- Teak plantation has replaced other trees in the forests. While it gives excellent timber, it does not provide MFP and the under growth or ground cover is also very poor. Multi layered forests are good for soil and water conservation and are better than having only one type of tree
- Forests are primarily located/ concentrated in certain parts of India, i.e.
 Central & Eastern India and the poorest people are living in these regions. If one looks at the tribal map and forest map in India they correspond
- The value of the crown of the tree (fruits, leaves, twigs and branches, etc.) should be of value for women and poor
- A good forest is one which has a good canopy cover otherwise it would result in soil erosion.
- New Supreme Court guidelines have made it very clear that only the indigenous trees are to be planted

however there has not been faithful implementation of these guidelines

- Bamboo is used both by artisans and industries however, there exists preference for the kind of bamboo which is used by industries. The price for which it is available for industries is highly subsidized as compared to the rates at which it is available to women and artisans
- Forest Conservation Act prohibits leasing of forest land to industry. However in practicality it is not always the case. For example in Ballarpur it is leased out to Paper Industry and there are similar examples in Raigad and. While one might not be terming it as lease but in reality the forests are being managed by the industry
- Historical traditions were in favour of timber and looked upon people as liabilities. Therefore even after a change in policy it is still taking lot of time in ensuring full implementation
- Women usually have to perform four types of roles – gatherers, casual workers, producers and managers
- Large number of poor people are dependent on forests. While fortunately India's forest cover has improved (there was a slight decline in dense forest cover in 1970s but after 1980s it has improved), the nature of forest has changed and the problem is primarily that of degradation of forests
- The forest policy in India has witnessed three phases:
 - 1875 1975: Forest for timber
 - 1975 1988: Social forestry on nonforest land
 - 1988 present: radical shift in policy and introduction of Joint Forest Management (JFM)

- The new Forest Policy introduced in 1988 has the following distinguishing features:
 - Environment and basic needs are given highest priority and economic benefits the last priority
 - Tribal' needs shall be the first charge on forests
 - Clear felling of natural forests has been banned
 - Clear provisions that exotic species cannot be introduced in forest
 - No mining leases are allowed unless sufficient safeguards
 - Industry to depend on farmers for raw material and there would be no subsidy to industries
 - Largest experiment in participatory forest management launched in 1990
- The speaker also discussed the differences between the old and new forest policy. While the old policy was tilted towards markets, the new one emphasizes subsistence
- The speaker shared the example of Kendu leaf collection in Orissa where 15 lakh poor people, mostly women, are involved in collection. For every 1 rupee that goes to the plucker government gets three rupee as royalty. Unlike Madhya Pradesh there is no mechanism of sharing royalty money with the pluckers. Further often the payments are delayed by three to fourth months forcing the pluckers to mortgage their cards
- The speaker while discussing the 0 situation of Non-Timber Forest Produce shared that the monopoly largely rests with the traders, industry and government which exploit the collectors. There are restrictions on self-collection, processing, storage and sale. There are no arrangements for credit. limited bargaining capacity and women entrepreneurs are unable to look for far-

66

Men don't stop us from speaking, but they do all the talking"

> Stories of Participatory Exclusion Village women, Gujarat

off markets. The extent of control can be understood from an example from Orissa where women were prosecuted for stocking brooms in their houses

- One of the participants raised the issue that unscientific collection of MFP needs to be addressed.
- The speaker tried to explain how the policy can be insensitive to the needs of the community residing in the forests by giving an example of the 12th Five Year Plan Approach Paper where it explicitly mentioned that "Forest gatherers should not be given the benefit of the minimum support price (MSP), as providing a high price for forest produce will not be in the interest of legal traders, who would be forced to pay a higher price to the gatherers"
- The speaker shared that the implementation of the Forest Rights Act (FRA) vis-à-vis community participation is very poor. As against 22 million hectare under JFM less than 1 lakh hectare is under community forestry

Summing up

Concluding the session the speaker highlighted how India is a case of "One Nation – Two Stories"

- Increased forest cover but one of the lowest forest productivity
- Booming demand for forest products but poorest forest people

 Best known co-forest management program in the world but no real transfer of community rights to use forest land and trade in forest products

The speaker shared that some of the reasons affecting bureaucracy not implementing prowoman policies include ignorance, indifference, unwillingness to change vested interest, collusion and conviction about patriarchy and urged the bureaucracy to play a more proactive role in safeguarding community's rights to forests.

Ø



Day Three

> Session 8 Closing the Gap for Adolescent Girls

Joachim Theis

Session Introduction

The presentation was organized in three sections – introduction to demographic situation, challenges and introduction to policies and programmes.

Session Highlights

- India is going through a massive demographic transition. While in 2010 the largest cohort of population was below the age of ten years, in the next decade the largest slice of this population would be in adolescence and youth age, i.e. in the working age³, which can accelerate development. Which means India needs to create 100 million jobs. However, one third of the growth will come from poorer and less literate states in the north. Further by 2030 India is expected to have the lowest dependency ratio⁴ among the BRIC countries.
- India is home to the largest number of adolescents in the world – 243 million, i.e. one fifth of India's population is in the age group of 10-19 years. Adolescence is described as a period of transition from childhood to adulthood. Evidence shows that health and nutrition practices that are put in place when people are at adolescence has lifelong impact

- Adolescence is also a time when gender roles diverge sharply. While the world for boys expands, it narrows for girls. Statistics from NFHS III for boys and girls aged 15-19 years old reveal that girls are at a disadvantage – 47 per cent girls have low Body Mass Index (BMI), 27 per cent are currently married, 24 per cent have begun child bearing, 56 per cent are anaemic, 36 per cent have not heard about HIV/AIDS, etc.
- Adolescent girls are faced with a number of challenges while growing-up, some of these are: gender biased sex selection, under five mortality, malnutrition, physical and sexual abuse, low school enrolment and dropout, child marriage, early pregnancy, early motherhood and maternal mortality, etc.

 85 per cent young women do not use sanitary napkin during menstruation, which leads to infection and chronic reproductive health problems

 In general there has not been much improvement in the nutritional status of adolescent girls in the past decade. It is, therefore, important to invest in adolescent nutrition to break the intergenerational cycle of under-nutrition. Research has shown that it is important to reduce child marriage and teenage pregnancy

 $^{^3}$ India will create 241 million additional working age population between 2010-2030

⁴ Dependency Ratio is the amount of population which is not working. Smaller dependency ratio is good for the economy

- Half of all girls dropout of school before completing tenth grade and the dropout is even higher in girls from disadvantaged or marginalized communities. Safety/ security concerns, distance of schools, lack of sanitation facilities in schools, etc. have an important bearing on girls missing school or dropping out. Further there are limited opportunities for vocational training after dropout
- There is a strong correlation between education and child marriage. The higher the education the lower are the chances of child marriage.
- Risk of maternal mortality is highest for adolescent girls and women above 35 years. The reason is that malnourished girls grow till 20 and if they become pregnant before that they stop growing leading to risk. What this means is that they are too small to give birth
- In recent times there has been rapid increase in private schools but the percentage of girls in private schools is less than boys.
- 20 per cent girls aged 15-19 years have experienced physical violence and 5 per cent have experienced sexual violence
- Adolescents are largely invisible as citizens and widely excluded from decisions that affect them
- Adolescent girls have less access to mobile phones, internet, radio, newsprint, television and other means of communication. They are often not aware of government programmes and services
- Big differences is evident within north and south India. Girls from Scheduled Caste (SC) and Scheduled Tribe (ST) communities in rural areas from northern India experience multiple vulnerabilities
- Comparatively data on adolescents is relatively good but biggest gap is in the

data on child labour (government has not allowed nationwide surveys)

- In developed countries as soon as equal opportunities are provided to girls, they do better. Urbanization is expected to have a huge social effect in increasing the age at marriage. For example, in Kerala child marriage rates have marginally increased in urban areas.
- There is a whole web of disadvantages faced by young girls and it is important to view it all together and understand how thinks are inter-linked.

	Gender-biased sex selection	Low birth weight	Infant mortality	
	Sexual violence	Teenage pregnancy	Maternal mortality	Open defecation
Trafficking	Sexual exploitation	Child marriage	Malnutrition of adolescent girls	Lack of sanitation
Lack of skills	Child labour and migration	School drop out	Lack of autonomy to make decisions	Lack of menstrual hygiene
Lack of decent work	Lack of economic opportunities	Lack of inheritance rights		

- To address this complex challenge, it is recommended to adopt an asset-based approach for adolescents (the assets framework lists down 40 assets that adolescents need for development)
 - Knowledge, Skills and Behaviours to survive and protect themselves
 - Services for Adolescents (example education, health, nutrition, etc.
 - Economic (example inheritance rights, savings, etc.). Women who have financial independence are not pushed around.
 - Social Support (peer networks, etc.)
 - Civic Engagement
- Asset framework helps in deciding what, how much and where to invest.
- No single intervention can solve the problem which is extremely complex. It is important to establish links between the different sectors. While the government

focuses on services for adolescents, it is equally important to focus on social norms

- Health Adolescent Reproductive \circ is another important area to invest. Preventing teenage pregnancies can be achieved through social protection and secondary education. Other drivers of change are preventive health check-ups, adolescent friendly reproductive and sexual health services including counselling and supplies, etc.
- It is important to identify the programmes that work and close down the ones that do not work. This will help in reinvesting the money in programmes that work
- In the area of menstrual hygiene and sanitation, UNICEF has implemented pilots on sanitary napkin production and installing vending machines and incinerators in schools
- Mental health is an emerging issue. In Tamil Nadu and Kerala with urbanization a number of problems such as depression, tobacco use, obesity, suicide, etc. are fast emerging. The key is to invest in prevention.
- UNICEF supports the government in its nutrition programmes such as SABLA and Weekly Iron folic Acid Supplementation (WIFS). Another area of focus is protection from child marriage, sexual abuse and exploitation
- It is important to include adolescents in urban planning so that urban spaces reflect their priorities
- Boys and girls have limited opportunities to exchange and it creates a problem. Gender socialization, therefore, is another area where UNICEF is keenly interested in and has introduced pilots
- There is a growing pressure to extend Right to Education (RTE) Act to the age of

18 years to ensure that all children receive secondary education

- India's primary school expenditure per student as a percentage of GDP is lowest among all BRIC countries. The investment in secondary education is better than primary
- India's female labour force participation 0 rate is lowest among BRIC countries. There is a need to improve economic assets and opportunities for adolescents particularly girls. This includes employability through knowledge and skills, basic education, vocational guidance, skills training, livelihood opportunities, entrepreneurship development and equal opportunities
- UNESCO-UNICEF research on internal migration highlighted that migration for adolescent girls and young women could be empowering, i.e. earning money may earn girls more respect and more freedom
- The speaker shared his own experiences of working on the issue of children's civil rights in Bangkok where the following civil rights were identified as important for children – birth certificates and access to justice; access to information that helps them develop, stay healthy and protect themselves from risks and hazards; able to express their opinions; access to helplines and complaint mechanisms, access to socio-economic support services
- Civic engagement of adolescents is an emerging area. It is important to involve adolescents in community decision making, ensure their representation in community committees and groups, seek views to influence public opinions, involving adolescents in media, etc.



Session 9 & 10 Violence Against Women and Children

Flavia Agnes

Session Introduction

The speaker started the session by stating that the session is not a departure from the earlier session but would rather build upon the issues highlighted and discussed earlier. The speaker narrated her own experience of how she entered the sector in 1980s during the court trial of a tribal girl who was raped while in police custody in Maharashtra.

Session Highlights

- The 'Mathura Case' (rape of a 16 year police custody tribal girl in in Maharashtra) triggered an Anti-Rape Campaign in early 1970s. It all started when the lower court acquitted the police officials on the ground that the girl had eloped with a boy and was working as maid and there were no marks of injury on her body which led the court to conclude that she had consented. The case then went to the High Court which ruled that quiet acquiescence or inability to fight does not imply consent and therefore ruled in favour of the girls. The policemen were removed from the service and they petitioned before the Supreme Court where once again the highest court overturned High Court's ruling in 1978 and concluded that there was no rape
- Following the order by the Supreme Court, four law teachers of Indian Law

Institute particularly Dr. Upendra Bakshi wrote an open letter to the Honourable Chief Justice of India that if such a judgement is allowed to remain in the law book then it would snuff up the hopes of millions of Mathura's in the country. The letter also got published in all the newspapers. Since this happened immediately post emergency period, it became a human rights issues and was gradually picked up by women's groups as they perceived it as a violation of dignity and a personal insult. For the first time women came together and it marked the beginning of women's movement in India. Ms. Agnes herself emerged from being a housewife and joined the movement. 8th March 1980 for the first time marked as Anti-Rape Day

• This was also a time when lot of dowry related deaths or newlywed women dying in husband's home were taking place. Initially these cases were recorded as stove burst cases or accidental cases and later recorded as suicide cases. Activists organized exhibitions of such violent crimes and it caught the imagination of media

• This ushered in a whole era of law reforms in the 1980s. First was a change in the Anti-Rape Law in 1983, 498A got introduced and 376 got amended (increased punishment)

66

The Mathura Case marked the beginning of women's movement in India

- It was a moment of great empowerment for the small group of women:
 - For the first time a custodial rape offence was introduced
 - For the first time the burden of proof shifted from the victim to the accused
 - For the first time aggravated punishment for sexual crimes was introduced
 - It was upheld that even if the girl had consented it would still be a crime because she was given in the custody and they were supposed to protect her
 - 498A got introduced which recognized for the first time that there could be a problem in marriage and opened up legal channels for women who are harassed or endangered in their husband's home
- The speaker shared how her own experience with domestic violence and then later on association with women's group helped her write her biography to highlight the issue of wife beating. Since she couldn't find the solution to the problem where "women die somewhere everyday", she felt it to be important to raise the point that unless one addresses regular violence one will not be able to control the larger violence against women. According to the data 40 per cent women in South Asia experience violence from intimate partners

- In 1986 the amendment in form of 304B provided that if the wife dies within seven years of marriage under unnatural circumstances then it will be presumed that it was a dowry death provided there is a nexus between demand for dowry and death
- According to the 1990 2011 NCRB data, the cases of the number of women dying as well rape cases increased
- This led to an agitation for bringing in a civil law for protecting women and after nearly two decades of sustained struggle the "Protection of Women from Domestic Violence" Act got introduced
- The next step was around the rape issues in the country:
 - First there was a problem with the definition of rape law, i.e. penetration was the only criteria
 - The notion that rape is done by an outsider got challenged and it gradually dawned that it also happens in the family
 - Then there were issues related to paedophilia, i.e. foreigners using children, giving them drugs, indulging children in sexual acts, photography or video and selling the content
 - There were issues with government run shelter homes.
 - Acid throwing cases started emerging. The speaker shared a recent example where a 16 year old child was made to drink acid and no public hospital was willing to treat her. The participants shared new laws introduced in Haryana and Karnataka where government will pay for the treatment of acid attack victims
 - Then there was this issue of undue emphasis on Section 376 or penis

penetration in cases where a child is molested

- There were also issues related to the attitude of Justice System – lot of emphasis on virginity and marriage, resulting in downplaying cases related to married women, tribal women, etc.
- Raping a woman becomes a way to teach a lesson to the community or family. For example over six million girls in Bangladesh were raped by Pakistan army during the civil war. Another example is that of the Gujarat riots based on which the speaker wrote in her book that "rape speaks through the lips of dead women"
- The speaker stressed that it is important to see the connection between marriage, dowry death and rape. There is so much fear of rape and therefore so much pressure to get the girl married
- While discussing issues related to the way women are treated in police stations and how having women Sis has not addressed the problem, Ms. Thakur shared the example of Gender friendly infrastructure in police stations in Kerala where the government has also made provision of funds with each police station to support women in form of legal aid, refreshments, transportation, etc.
- The speaker said that instead of women police stations there could be a desk with two women counsellors in each police station

The Maharashtra Experience

The post lunch session focused on the experiences gained by Majlis/ Rahat in Maharashtra state.

• There is a hope that newer law would give more rights but in reality there is no connection between law and rights. One needs to implement the law and make it happen

- Majlis is a cultural and legal centre which provides legal aid to women. Earlier the organization was only practicing civil law cases but three years back it started the program of supporting rape victims
- It started three years back when a four year old child got raped in a school close to Majlis office. The police refused to file a case for three days and lot of things were said about the child's mother that she is insane, cooking up the story, etc. It was then that the organization decided to do something
- For the first three days no case was 0 registered. It was only when the child continued complaining of pain that the mother took the child to a private hospital where the doctors questioned why no case has been registered so far. The case got registered and also received media coverage. Since the child belonged to scheduled caste therefore the case was handed over to ACP for investigation. The case went through many ups and downs the four year child was made to identify the accused in court, the Judge changed five times, the public prosecutor (PP) changed six times, and so on. Majlis then used the reference to the Supre Court Judgement called 'Sakshi Judgment' where the court said that the defence lawyer cannot question the child directly. defence then submitted The а questionnaire for the child which contained 80 questions for the child. Majlis team rehearsed with the child and in the end conviction happened

• Thereafter many organizations started referring similar cases to Majlis. The recent Delhi gang rape case once again brought the focus back to the violent crimes against women

- In 2012, government took cognizance and introduced Protection of Children from Sexual Offences (POCSO) Act which broadened the definition of penetration. It could be orally, inner, penis, any object any part of the body. Investigation and court trial has to be child friendly and the age of consent was also raised up to 18 years. The Verma Committee was setup and gave report within a month. With a result that there no longer exists a confusion in the definition of rape law
- Under POCSO both girl and boy child are taken under consideration and it says that anyone who violates, i.e. it is no longer male and whosoever does it gets implicated
- Aggravated crime is defined as the one committed by people in position of power (government officials, teachers, family, and doctors) and includes crimes where more than one person is involved, pregnant child is violated, grave injury caused, severe bodily injury caused, communal violence, caste violence, etc. In such cases the minimum punishment is ten years
- Non-penetrative crimes also comes under sexual assault
- The speaker stressed that no law can be considered as law till the last person living in a remote place understands what it is. With this in mind Majlis started a program and started visiting police stations. Over a two year period it covered 92 police stations
- Majlis, in the name of Rahat, signed a memorandum of understanding with the DWCD and also collaborated with the police. The organization also supported in drafting circulars and disseminating these to all police stations in the state. Every time they faced a situation when police was not cooperating they showed

them the circular. It was then that the Joint Commissioner of Police, Maharashtra suggested that training programmes should be organized for police officials.

- The organization developed resource material in Marathi and has so far conducted six training batches. The impact is already visible – a new scheme called the 'Victim Compensation Scheme; got introduced making financial allocations of INR 2 lakhs for rape victims and 3 lakhs for acid attack victims
- District Trauma Teams were also formed 0 to help the child go through the entire DWCD system. One official was designated to monitor the functioning of these team. The DWCD also organized meeting of prosecutors, health officers, DWCD officers and fixed accountability bv explaining their roles and responsibilities. A follow-up takes place once in six months.

Summing up

The speaker concluded her session by stating that in the end what is important is to see how the system is treating the child and that the child must not be subjected to such humiliating treatment/ interrogation. She left the participants to reflect and explore solutions to the following two questions

- Can we find ways to improve the implementation of laws and make the system work till the last mile?
- Can such a convergence model be introduced and will it work in your states?



Session 11 Sexual Harassment at Work Place

Jaspreet Talwar

Session Introduction

The session started with an introduction by Ms. Thakur that this session holds special significance for all participants as this is an issue that affects everyone. The session has also been mandatory in all training programmes that are held in the academy. Ms. Talwar started the discussion by drawing participant's attention towards the most significant case involving Mr. KPS Gill and the time it took for the lady victim to finally get justice in this case. General reaction at that point of time was that it was too trivial an issue to be raised in that manner but she demonstrated lot of courage in taking it up on her own accord and finally after a long legal battle she finally received justice after 18 years. The speaker distributed an awareness questionnaire on what amounts to sexual harassment, which was followed by a discussion on the subject.

Session Highlights

 Sexual harassment is any unwelcome words or actions of a sexual nature. It includes such unwelcome sexually determined behaviour whether directly or implication as physical contact and advances, demand or request for sexual favours, sexually coloured remarks, showing pornography⁵

- The Supreme Court guidelines are applicable to government, public sector, private sector, salary/ wage earners, volunteers, persons drawing honorarium. The objective of these guidelines is to prevent sexual harassment ⁶ and to provide procedures for resolution/ settlement/ prosecution
- The following examples of behaviour can be considered as sexual harassment at workplace:
 - Commenting on personal appearance
 - Making comments with sexual overtones and suggestive remarks having double meaning
 - Unnecessary touching/ prolonged handshakes
 - Placing hand on the shoulders
 - Brushing against body
 - Staring intently at a woman's body
 - Teasing by using names such as 'sweetheart', 'darling', 'honey', etc.
 - Unnecessary, obscene or threatening telephone calls
 - Taking pictures using mobile phone/ camera surreptitiously and without seeking express permission
 - Commenting on a woman's fertility, pregnancy, sexuality, etc.
 - Stalking
 - Unzipping, loosening belt/ buttons in front of woman colleagues

⁶ Sexual harassment constitutes a violation of Fundamental Rights 14, 15, 19 and 21

⁵ Vishakha vs. State of Rajasthan, Supreme Court 1997

- Unnecessarily calling to the cabin on pretext of work
- Locking the cabin while discussing work with lone woman employee
- Persuading a woman employee to accept a car/ bike lift
- Purposely organizing out of station tours, site visits in such a manner to ensure physical company of a particular woman colleague
- Sending inappropriate emails or messages
- Watching soft porn, pornography, lingerie-ads etc. on office computer or television especially in corridors, recreation rooms, common areas accessible to all
- Reading aloud news concerning rape of women or other news items in a sensational manner and using it to ridicule and gossip about women's sexuality
- Linking up with bosses especially women private secretaries
- Character assassination of a woman employee
- Sexist and misogynist humour
- Earlier Section 354/509 under IPC were used in cases of outraging the modesty of women. Now after this Act IPC has been amended and new sections have been added (Section 354 a, b, c, d, e)
- The speaker also discussed with the participants the various steps that the employer needs to take to ensure a harassment free environment in the organizations:
 - Issue express prohibitions of sexual harassment at work place (to be published and circulated)
 - Provide effective complaint procedure and remedies including awarding of compensation to woman victim

- Form complain committee as per the guidelines. If the employer fails to form this committee then there is a fine of INR 50,000. The committee should be headed by a woman, fifty percent of the members should be women and must include a third party/ Non-Government Organization (NGO). Women employees from all levels should have access to this committee
- Once the complaints committee is in place, all complaints of sexual harassment must be referred to this committee. The enquiry has to be time bound and must be done within 90 days. The committee would then submit its report to the head of the organization with recommendations and the head of the organization has to decide within 60 days of the report submitted by committee
- It is mandatory to lodge police complaint by the employer. Further the employer should take all necessary steps to ensure that the victim is not further victimized and has access to counselling facilities. In circumstances where the complainant wishes to seek a transfer, the employer must allow her to do so

Summing up

Concluding the session, the speaker reflected on the role that each of the participants can play in their respective organizations. They need to go back and review whether the complaints committee is in place or not and take necessary steps to ensure that the environment in the work place is safe for everyone.





0

Day Four



Session 12 Gender and Livelihood

Sarada Muraleedharan

Session Introduction

The session was on livelihood and particularly from the perspective of livelihood for poor and women.

Session Highlights

- The speaker introduced the concept of Self Help Group (SHG). The Integrated Rural Development Programme (IRDP) started in the 1980s as a big anti-poverty programme
- o In absolute numbers India has the greatest population of poor and also has the dubious distinction of being an extremely inequitable society. India has managed to keep the poverty line poor because the definition and identification of poverty is abysmal. What is absolute minimum for quality of life is not where the poverty line starts. If one has to compare poverty in India with what is around then one would realize that India is doing a far worse job. The poverty figures would be closer to fifty percent. Further poverty is skewed, i.e. the proportion of poor varies across states and the quality also changes
- This was the period when *garibi hatao* (remove poverty) slogan was coined and IRDP launched. The scheme had a simple intention, i.e. provide assets to poor and give it as a combination of loan and grants. The scheme was focused on Below Poverty Line (BPL) population

- 0 The scheme was focused on individual beneficiaries and it created District Rural (DRDA) Development Agency and systems through which Rural Development Department the and government work
- Along with it there was also a training program called Training of Rural Youth for Self-Employment (TRYSEM). The premise of the programme was that since poor lack skills therefore give them training
- Then the government also introduced Development of Women and Children in Rural Areas (DWCRA), which was a program to support women's collectives
- However the experience was mixed in many cases there were loan defaults, there was total disassociation of bankers with poor as they default, there was a feeling that since money is not going as production loans therefore not creating assets, and so on
- In late 1980s another intervention popularly known as the 'Grameen Bank Model' was being carried out in Bangladesh. The model was to invest in poor women
- Banks have problem lending to poor and especially no bank was interested in small lending. So the instinct of the banker was not to lend to the poor. The idea of Prof. Muhammad Yunus (the visionary behind the model) was to

66

The idea of Grameen Bank was to collectivize women as the peer pressure would make then good borrowers and also ensure repayment of loans

collectivize women as the peer pressure would make them good borrowers and ensure repayment. Further instead of giving twenty loans bank can give one loan and there is less transaction cost and the groups owing to peer pressure ensure payments comes back to the bank. The bank can be happy as there is less transaction cost and the group can also repay due to peer pressure

- Another idea behind SHG formation was that women in family do not have access to money but they are responsible for managing household affairs. This created a problem as one hand there were women who are responsible for managing the affairs and on the other hand they had no access to money. As a result the standards of living are compromised and the women and children would suffer the most
- The idea was first to try and get them to save and create a collective corpus which is in the name of SHG. Saving money in collective corpus also saves women from coerced payments in case she has an alcoholic husband and other similar problems
- Out of this money internal loans are given. From these internal loans women are able to make payments to grocery store, education children and after some

point of time they start using it for income generating activities

- When the money starts flowing back in the family the head of household also begins to realize the importance of her contribution and the position of the woman in the house goes up. Initially there is resistance from men but gradually it changes as women also start gaining recognition in the public spaces
- Poor have an aspiration for better life, especially for their children, and SHG became a conduit for reaching this aspiration
- In Karnataka, a number of organizations started setting up SHGs of women and convinced Reserve Bank of India (RBI) and National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development (NABARD) to provide bank credit to these SHGs. They agreed to the idea of institutional credit and credit to SHG begin to be seeing as priority lending
- This kick started (mid 1980s) SHG Bank Linkage programme. Taking lessons from this, Swarnjayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana (SGSY) program started and ran for about 10-15 years. It however ran into quite a bit of trouble as SHG were seen as enterprises of the poor and so all other processes of savings, internal credit, grading, etc. were bypassed. Some three million SHGs were created and these were all paper SHGs (they came, got their subsidy and disintegrated)
- Even the genuine SHGs were finding it difficult to sustain themselves over a period of time. BPL identification became another problem. BPL is a value as there are many benefits attached with the result that everyone wanted to be BPL. The people who genuinely need to come into BPL couldn't gain access

- There were also significant differences between north and south. In south SHGs survived, bank linkages functioned smoothly and about 80 per cent of the total SHG credit in India was captured by four southern states in India
- In this backdrop the Planning Commission appointed Radhakrishna Committee in 2007. The Committee looked at the Andhra Pradesh and Kerala model and identified factors that led to this success:
 - Both the states were working on a mission mode, i.e. they had created a separate mission
 - There was a mix of professionals (subject experts appointed on contractual positions) and officials that created an impact
 - It was all women SHGs (Uttar Pradesh is struggling under National Rural Livelihood Mission as 80 per cent are male SHGs)
 - SHGs were federated and community leadership created. SHG as a collective was not strong enough but when it is further collectivized, i.e. collective of SHGs then it can also negotiate power situation, leverage entitlements, etc.
 - Another lesson learnt was to saturate the Panchayat, i.e. every single person who can come into SHG must come join the SHG. Community's perception of poverty is different from the official version. If a system of participatory identification is followed then one can successfully bring all poor together
 - Income poverty is only manifestation but poverty is also social, political and so on. For example a woman sarpanch who is not allowed to participate during panchayat meeting

is poverty. That is to say that poverty is also result of injustice.

- Tackling all of that required another kind of collective strength, i.e. addressing poverty required multidimensional approach by looking at food security, health, education, etc.
- Therefore it was realized that there has to be focus on building capability of institutions of poor. As a result lots of trainings happened
- In Andhra Pradesh there was a World Bank and UNDP supported pilot. In Kerala there was political decentralization. However, women were still not coming to the gram sabhas (village assembly). The government then decided to introduce Kudumbshree for women. Since women were also seen as noncorrupt therefore the idea was to create collectives of women who will get into gram sabha. In three years of Kudumbshree the participation of women during gram sabhas went from 15 to 80 per cent
- The speaker also spoke about the reasons for which the SHGs of women are preferred
 - The Perception is that women are concerned about family, it is easier to reach out to the family through the women, they have savings habit and can manage household expenditure better, they are more trustworthy, they have more time, etc.
 - However, the reality is that it is convenient as they don't have a voice, they are more manageable, they can be controlled, they are disciplined, they are susceptible to peer pressure, they are apolitical and basically it is convenient

- India scores low on Gender Inequality Index (0.617) and ranks 126 out of 135 countries
- Women are usually excluded, marginalized and this devaluation leads to commodification which in turn leads to non-productivity and burden of expenditure. There is now a need to rethink how one values women, i.e. she is not the route, instead she is the destination
- There is a need to look at WSHGs differently and support women in finding voice through this medium, inclusion in the economy, accessing resources, addressing powerlessness, addressing exclusion, enabling participation, claiming rights, equalizing equity, etc.
- *Kudumbshree* is a three tier federation of poor women. 98 per cent panchayat wards (2.54 lakh NHGs) comprising of 39.5 lakh women are covered and the programme has also created 57,400 Joint Liability Groups of women farmers of about 3.03 lakh women. 18,000 group enterprises have been formed and INR 1,904 crore bank linkage has been established
- In Kerala the labour cost is phenomenal and there is huge fragmentation of land. High migration results in large number of absentee landlords contributing in creating huge cultivable fallow, high conversion of land for garden or nonagricultural purposes, etc. Women participation as agricultural labour is low and as cultivator almost non-existent. Women Work Participation Rate in cashew labour/ unorganized sector is lowest at 15.99. There also exists significant gender difference in male and female casual labour rate
- The speaker then reflected on how *Kudumbshree* made an impact on the

National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (NREGA)

- All mates under NREGA were Kutumbshree women
- Job card distribution was absolutely low when *Kudumbshree* was introduced. Kudumbshree came into job card mobilization, labour budgeting with the result that not only job card distribution improved but also the technical knowledge of women improved and they formed themselves as labour groups and started negotiating labour wage rates
- Women gained recognition as skilled labour and organized themselves as farmers. They also took on cultivation on cultivable fallow
- This resulted in getting 12 lakh women workers in NREGA
- Due to collective strength they are now able to channelize many things – NREGA, collective farming, etc. The Krishi Bhawan works with them, *panchayat* supports them, and so on
- *Kudumbshree* helped them graduate from being an unskilled labourer to being a producer
- Started learning scientific modes of agriculture. They have become women collectives for food security, reviving eco-systems and adopting sustainable agricultural practices
- It also helped in bringing rights perspective into a livelihood program



Session 13 Trafficking of Women and Children

Swasti Rana

Session Introduction

The speaker introducing the session started by showcasing a short film which was prepared around 2007 when the United Nations launched a Global Initiative to fight human trafficking.



The speaker introduced that the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) was established in 1997 and the head office is in Vienna. The regional office for South Asia is located in Delhi and covers six countries. UNODC plays a significant role in:

- Assisting states in ratifying and implementing international treaties as well as development of domestic legislation on drugs, crime and terrorism
- Providing technical cooperation projects to enhance capacities of states to counteract illicit drugs, crime and terrorism
- Undertaking research and analytical work to increase knowledge and understanding of drugs and crime issues

and expand evidence base for policy and operational decisions

Introducing the presentation the speaker informed that it is organized in three sections – trends, what has been done, and challenges/ way ahead.

Session Highlights

- United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime (UNTOC) has three important protocols:
 - Protocol to prevent, supress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children
 - Protocol against the smuggling of migrants by land, air and sea
 - Protocol against the illicit manufacturing and trafficking in firearms, their parts and components and ammunition
- The Government of India ratified UNOTC in 2011 and is the only country in the region to ratify it. The government is now working on designing a legislation that can be introduced to ensure implementation of UNOTC in India
- Before UNTOC there was the SAARC Convention on Preventing and Combating Trafficking in Women and Children for Prostitution, which signed by all countries. There was a limitation in this Convention as trafficking was understood only for the purpose of prostitution and

trafficking for other purposes was not included. While it is true that the primary reason still remains prostitution, there are many other aspects to trafficking

- UNOTC came into force in 2003 and is the first international legal instrument to provide a comprehensive definition of trafficking as well as comprehensive measures for combating it
- The UNOTC focuses on prevention (prevent and combat trafficking of persons), protection (protect and assist victims) and cooperation among state parties



- To help participants better understand 0 the definition of 'trafficking in persons' or TIP, the speaker shared an example from West Bengal – neighbour comes and ask the mother to send her daughter with her to Delhi where she is promised a guaranteed placement with a very good family. Mother accepts the offer and sends her child. The neighbour accompanies the child and after exchanging many hands the girl child is finally sold to a brothel. The act involved recruitment, transport, transfer, harbouring (kept overnight in the lodge) and receipt (sold off to brothel). Means used included fraud, deception, vulnerability, giving payments or benefits. The purpose was prostitution.
- The speaker further clarified that one doesn't have to establish everything, even if one thing is established it would constitute trafficking in persons

- If a child is below 18 years of age then the consent is irrelevant. Even if there is an adult who says that she has come of her free will and any one of these charges/ illicit means is established then the consent becomes immaterial
- The speaker shared the findings from the UNODC Global Report on TIP, 2012
 - Victims of 138 nationalities detected in 118 countries
 - Most commonly identified forms of trafficking are – sexual exploitation (58 per cent) and forced labour (36 per cent)
 - While the trafficking for sexual exploitation has declined from 78 per cent in 2009, trafficking for forced labour has increased from 20 per cent in 2009
 - Other under-reported forms of exploitation includes forced marriages, organ removal, exploitation of children in begging, warfare, etc.
 - 75 per cent of trafficked victims are women and girls and of these 27 per cent are children
 - Globally there are 20.9 million victims of forced trafficking, which includes trafficking for forced labour and sexual exploitation
 - Annual profits generated US\$ 32 billion
 - In Europe, Central Asia and America trafficking for sexual exploitation is common
 - In Africa, Middle East, South and East Asia and the Pacific trafficking for forced labour is common
 - Situation is grave with even 4-6 year olds being rescued from brothel
 - India is seen as a source, transit and destination country for trafficking of men, women and children subjected

50

to forced labour and sex trafficking and 90 per cent of the total trafficking in India is internal

- In 2007 Ministry of Women and Child Development (MWCD) conducted a study which reported the presence of at least 2.8 million sex workers in India. 35.4 per cent of them had entered the trade before 18 years
- The speaker discussed the legal framework in India to combat trafficking:
 - Government of India in May 2011 ratified UNTOC and its supplementary protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children
 - The Article 23 of the Constitution of India talks about prohibiting trafficking
 - There is a special legislation called the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act (ITPA) 1956.
 - Goa Children's Act, 2003 for the first time one state brought out a comprehensive definition
 - Indian Penal Code (IPC), 1860
 - The Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2000
 - Information Technology Act, 2000
 - The Criminal Law (Amendment) Ordinance 2013 under which the Section 370 and 370 (A) have broadened the definition of trafficking: Section 370 - whosoever for the purpose of exploitation recruits, transports, harbours or receives a person by using threat, force, abduction, abuse of power, fraud, etc." and Section 370A whoever despite knowing or having reasons to believe that a child has been trafficked employees such child in any form of labour shall be

punishedwithrigorousimprisonment of term not less than 5years and similarly whoever despiteknowing that an adult has beentrafficked employees such an adultfor labour shall be punished for threeyears and may extend up to five years

- The speaker further explained that there are still a number of limitations in these legal provisions. While there is no single comprehensive law, provisions from many laws can be brought together and applied to make the case fool proof. For example the provisions under IPC can also be applied
- It is important to understand that trafficking does take place of men and young boys also. Trafficked person could be a male or female of any age
- The speaker reiterated that high percentage of children are being trafficked and law agencies are duty bound to rescue such children. Further in such cases consent is immaterial
- Going further the speaker said that trafficking is an organized crime and therefore it is important to break the network



- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in trafficking of children for forced labour in India
 - NCPCR reported child labour problem in BT Cotton fields of Gujarat and Rajasthan where children mainly

come from Bihar, Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal

- Children are also trafficked from Nepal and Bangladesh and eastern part of India to work in coal mines in Meghalaya
- Children are trafficked from Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh, Odisha, Assam, West Bengal and Madhya Pradesh for domestic labour through illegal placement agencies operating in Delhi/ NCR
- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in trafficking for Commercial Sexual Exploitation
 - West Bengal, Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka, Maharashtra and Odisha continue to be high source areas for trafficking to red light areas across India. There has also been a movement away from typical red light areas to residential colonies, market places, etc.
 - Women are also being trafficked from Central Asian Countries such as Uzbekistan, Azerbeijan, etc.
- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in trafficking for forced marriages
 - Women and girls are lured from Assam, West Bengal, Jharkhand and Odisha to marry men in Punjab and Haryana where the sex ratio is really bad. Similar cases also reported from Kutch area in Gujarat
- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in trafficking to Middle East
 - As entertainers
 - Sex racket operating in the gulf
 - Camel Jockeys trafficking of boys as entertainers

- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in trafficking and adoption rackets
 - Cases reported from Jharkhand, Andhra Pradesh, Maharashtra and Delhi about trafficking of children for adoption
- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in child trafficking and begging rackets
 - Gangs of traffickers kidnap children from Nepal, Bangladesh, West Bengal, Odisha and Bihar
- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in trafficking of children by unregistered homes in South India
 - Children from north-eastern states (Manipur) are being trafficked by well networked groups to Tamil Nadu
 - Unregistered homes in Tamil Nadu and Kerala
- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in trafficking for child labour in the name of education
 - Traffickers in the garb of clerics in Bihar (*Madarsas*) recruiting children for cheap labour
- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in organ trafficking
 - Reports of organ trafficking from India
 - Kidney racket
- The UNODCS study has highlighted the following trends in missing children and human trafficking
 - Link between missing children and human trafficking
 - According to NCRB from 2009-11 approximately 177,660 children were missing out of which 122,190 were traced and 55,470 continue to remain missing. Of these 64 per cent were minor girls

- As a fallout of the Nithari Case (where families reported missing girl children and nobody took notice, later the children were found to be raped and murdered), the supreme Court in 2012 made registering of FIR compulsory in case of missing children
- Trafficking through illegal recruitment 0 agencies
 - Fraudulent advertisements for jobs abroad and fake recruitments
 - Women trafficked for prostitution in the name of domestic work
 - Illegal recruitment agencies are active in North East, Kerala, Maharashtra and north Bengal
- Since 2006 MWCD has taken a lot of 0 initiatives to address the issues, most prominent of these being:
 - Formation of Central and State **Advisory Committees**
 - Introduction of Integrated Child Protection Scheme (ICPS)
 - Ujjwala scheme and Swadhar Greh (reform home)
- The Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA) has also undertaken a number of steps in this direction:
 - Establishment of Anti-Human Trafficking Units (AHTUs)
 - Training and sensitization of police, public prosecutors and judiciary at national, state and district level
 - MHA has issued series of advisories on trafficking issues in respect of investigation, linking missing children with human trafficking, rescue, repatriation, etc.
 - MHA in collaboration with the Indira Gandhi National Open University (IGNOU) has started a six month webbased course

- Ministry of Labour & Employment has also undertaken a number of steps in this direction:
 - National Policy on Domestic Workers
 - Scheme for rehabilitation of bonded labour
 - Protocol on prevention, rescue, repatriation and rehabilitation of trafficked and migrant child labour
- Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs has 0 also undertaken a number of steps in this direction:
 - Setting-up shelter homes for Indian women in distress
 - Scheme for providing legal/ financial assistance to women who are deserted by spouses overseas
 - Action against illegal recruitment agencies
- The speaker responding to a question 0 said that responsibility cannot solely rest with police and many stakeholders need to come together. Holistic response by many agencies including the Law Enforcement Officials, the agencies concerned with justice delivery, welfare, development, etc. as well as NGOs, civil society, media, academician, etc. is necessary to combat such a complex and challenging problem
- The most significant bottlenecks faced 0 include:
 - Due priority is not accorded to cases of trafficking in persons
 - understanding Limited of the problem among law enforcement and criminal justice practioners
 - Inadequate victim assistance, protection, post-rescue care, referral and rehabilitation service
 - Inadequate data and statistics on crimes against women and girls
 - Lack of international and regional integration/ cooperation in the

investigation and prosecution of these crimes

- Attitudinal issues resulting in treating victims of trafficking as criminals

Summing up

The speaker discussed and listed down key steps that can be taken to overcome some of the challenges mentioned above:

- Need for an attitudinal and behavioural change as well as improved knowledge of laws and procedures
- Need for focus on trafficked persons as victims and alleviating their suffering
- Need for strengthening the AHTUs with improved service for victims, better cooperation with police stations, NGOs
- Need for more focus on the issue of missing children
- Ensuring minimum standards of care in shelter homes
- Speedy trials. For example in Mumbai where trial happened through video conferencing. Specific court to deal with trafficking has been setup in Maharashtra
- Witness and victim protection
- More budget allocation for skill development
- Policy Intervention required for reintegration/ alternative livelihoods for victims
- Specialized skills of investigation
- Addressing the organized dimension of the crime
- An integrated multi-sectoral approach



Session 14 Gender Budgeting

Sarojini Ganju Thakur

Session Introduction

The session on gender responsive budgeting was aimed at bringing together lot of issues that had already been discussed during the course of the workshop. The speaker also shared that globally there is a strong movement towards financing gender equality. The argument is that mere legal and constitutional provisions would not serve the purpose if there is no implementation. Therefore making budgetary provisions towards gender equality is important to ensure that women are treated as equal citizens.

Session Highlights

- The presentation was organized into four sections - what are gender responsive budgets (GRB), the process of preparing gender responsive budgets, what have been the experiences in India, and the next steps
- GRB is not about budgeting but it is more like a monitoring tool to understand whether gender equality is being achieved or not. It is a monitoring mechanism to make sure that one is able to achieve gender equality and gender mainstreaming
- Some countries have prepared women's budget, which basically includes schemes that are 100 per cent focused on women

- GRB or Gender Sensitive Budget are same but women's budget could imply that men are not considered and budget is separate. GRB is a process that aims to analyse (analysis is central to GRB) how effectively governments policies, programmes and budgetary allocations respond to the differentiated needs of and impacts on women, men, girls and boys and the extent to which they promote gender equality
- It is important that planners disaggregate during planning exercise, i.e. not only talk about men and women but also scheduled tribe men and scheduled tribe women, scheduled caste women and scheduled caste men, and so on
- The process can be initiated in two ways

 one could be by looking at the budget, for example how much of the total budget is being spent on violence against women; and the other way is to start by analysing the issues, i.e. what is that women need
- The budget does not recognize some kinds of work, e.g. reproductive work. It is important that one takes into account the invisible part of economy or unpaid work (unpaid work is always done by women)

66

Women represent 48 per cent of the population but access to and control over services and resources is limited

- GRBs are a gender mainstreaming strategy and passes through two stages, i.e. gender sensitive budget analysis and formulation of gender sensitive budget
- The Government of India has created GRB Cell in 57 different ministries. However global experiences indicate that many countries started with one or two ministries as a result the work is more focused and produces better results
- There are a number of ways in which GRBs can be taken up – one can start with few programs/ one can look at the full budget or specific sectors/ one can look at the expenditure or revenue side/ one can look at levels – state, districts, blocks/ panchayats/ one can include both post budget analysis and budget allocation, and so on
- GRBs are not about making separate budgets for women, men, girls or boys and neither is it about setting aside certain amount for women in all budgets. It is about making provision for women and men based on their needs in order to attain gender equality
- The speaker then discussed the rationale for preparing GRBs:
 - Women represent 48 per cent of the population but access to and control over services and resources is limited
 - Raise awareness of impacts in budget and policy about gender issues

- Enhance accountability of governments to their budgetary and policy commitments
- Identify felt needs of women and reprioritize expenditure to meet these needs
- Tracking public expenditure against commitments, role of care economy and unpaid work
- Improve participation of civil society and women in planning and budgeting policies
- Check whether allocated money is spent and who it reaches
- Changing the types of goods and services delivered by government
- To change policy, budget allocations and outcomes to promote gender equality, enhance linkage between economic and social goals
- People both within and outside the government can work on gender responsive budgets, i.e. activists, academicians, ordinary citizens and their groups, etc.
- There are three categorization of 0 expenditure - women specific targeted employment expenditure, equal opportunity expenditure and mainstream expenditure. India has adopted two categorization - Pro-women allocations where women specific allocations are 100 per cent and the second type is where it is between 30-99 per cent. In India all budgets are analysed to see how much is for women but the problem is that it also takes into account salaries
- The speaker tried explaining the process of preparing GRBs by quoting an example of a scheme being implemented in Gujarat.
 - The process should start by identifying the problem and

understanding what is the position of women in that particular problem

- For example the Government of Gujarat introduced a maternity care scheme titled Chiranjeevi Yojana in areas where the rate of maternal and infant mortality was very high. The objective was to reduce the mortality rates. When it was analysed further the government realized that there isn't enough institutional care to meet the demand of cases that are of serious nature. What they did was they agreed that the government doesn't have enough institutions and therefore decided to partner with the sector institutions private for delivering children in emergency treatment. As a first step a pilot project was introduced in five worst performing districts and reviewed it at the end of six months. What they found was that the budget allocation was not enough (not enough money allocated for post-delivery care) and revised the budget allocation as well as introduced transport allowance. Now the scheme is being implemented in all districts and has contributed in bringing down the mortality rate.
- The following steps needs to be followed for undertaking GRB process: (1) analysis of the situation of women and men, girls and boys in a given sector, (2) assessment of the extent to which the sector's policy addresses the gender issues and gaps described in the first step, (3) assessment of the adequacy of budget allocations to implement the gender sensitive policies and programmes identified earlier, (4) monitoring whether the money was spent as

planned, what was delivered and to whom, and (5) assessment of the impact of the policy/ programme/ scheme and the extent to which the situation has been changed in the direction of greater equality/ and how commitments are being met

- The GRB process can be carried out with the help of the following tools:
 - Gender aware policy appraisal
 - Gender disaggregated beneficiary assessment
 - Gender disaggregated public expenditure incidence analysis
 - Gender disaggregated analysis on impact of time use
 - Gender aware long-term planning
 - Gender aware budget statement
 - Spatial mapping of resources
 - Disaggregated tax incidence analysis
- MWCD has formulated guidelines in form of checklists which can be used for planning to ensure that it is gender sensitive. The guidelines assist in reviewing public expenditure and policy from a gender perspective. However the starting point is to have gender disaggregated data
- Many states have moved away from input oriented planning to outcome oriented planning. In GRB also the focus is not on expenditure but on outcomes
- Further impact assessment is very important. In 13th Five Year Plan there is also a mention of introducing Gender Audit
- Globally more than 65 countries have GRBs. Initiatives started in 1980s in Australia and South Africa. In Australia a group of bureaucrats (all women) started analysing budgets. Similarly at the end of apartheid, South Africa also initiated GRB as women had suffered the most during the apartheid. There is also biennial



reporting by Finance Ministers of all commonwealth countries on progress in GRBs

- In East Africa (Tanzania and Ugnada) NGOs drove the programme and the government is now implementing GRB in partnership with NGOs
- In India, GRBs find mention in all five year plans but there has been no consistency. It was only during the Tenth Five Year Plan that commitment to gender budgeting was visible
- The Department of Women and Child Development and Finance both have an important role. At present momentum is mostly coming from DWCD but they do not have a clout, therefore the lead has to be taken by Finance. For this purpose both these departments would need capacity building on GRB and monitoring
- GRB is also a tool for empowering the panchayat raj system. While reservation has been created for women but they need to be aware of financial powers and influence, resource allocation, participate in decision making, etc.
- Kerala started with analysis of what women need and then designed a scheme. In Kerala there are GRBs related to infrastructure, roads and ports. Gender Friendly Infrastructure Scheme in Kerala includes construction of toilets, rooms, innovative housing schemes, ports, etc. In police station they have created separate waiting rooms for women and also investing in skills enhancement
- For sustainability of the GRB process, what is required are political and bureaucratic commitment, skills, time and support, civil society participation and convergence in the effort of DWCD and Finance
- GRB is not the answer to everything and what is also important is to finance

gender equality. Self Help Groups (SHGs) towards this end provide a good solution

Summing-up

Concluding the session the speaker said that while the progress is slow, many states have started preparing GRBs and in some of the states (Kerala and Rajasthan) the progress is better than national level. Further it is important to include multi-stakeholders such as civil society and ministries must take ownership, long term commitment is required and the Finance department needs to take the lead. The speaker also gave the example of Pakistan where the Finance took lead in bringing about some important legislations. Further all round awareness and capacity building measures would be required to ensure ownership and institutionalization of the GRB processes.





0

Day Five



Session 15 Analyzing Organization through a Gender Sensitive Lens

Sarojini Ganju Thakur

Session Introduction

The session was meant as an introspective session to understand what is happening in the participant's own organizations. Each organization has a culture and it determines the outputs that come. Therefore there is a reason why everyone is now talking about affirmative actions and specially mentioning that women are encouraged to apply. It is generally believed that the style of management changes with the number of women who are part of an organization. In order to change the culture of an organization one needs to have a critical mass of women, which would be roughly around 30 per cent.

Session Highlights

- An organization is determined by its norms and values and how people relate to each other. This manifests itself in the nature of who exercises power and how it impacts on the way policies, plans and things are delivered
- In the 1970s there were very few women in all international and multi-lateral institutions and as such there was no concept of gender. Planning was considered to be of, by and for men and women were in that welfaristic and protectionist mode
- In the 20th century specific things happened in Norway and Sweden and they became gender sensitive. In Norway

political parties ensured that there were safe seats for women. It is driven by the consideration that power and who exercises it determines the organization culture

- The speaker conducted a small exercise which was meant to understand how people relate with each other in the organization and ponder "is there really an environment in my organization to deal with gender issues/ bias"
- To provide a meaningful direction to the discussions, the speaker explained how gender concerns are being dealt within the bureaucracy:
 - Article 14 of the Constitution created an opportunity of equality. However in the society women were viewed as supplementary earner and never as the main earner
 - As per the IAS Recruitment Rule 1954 there was a clause that stated "no married woman shall be entitled as of right to be appointed to the service and when a woman appointed to the service subsequently marries the central government may if the maintenance of the efficiency of the service so requires call upon her to resign". This was deleted in 1972
 - Indian Foreign Service (IFS) Rules: A women member of the service shall obtain the permission of the government in writing before her

marriage is solemnized. At any time after the marriage a woman member of the service may be required to resign from service if the government is satisfied that her family and domestic commitments are likely to come in the way of due and efficient discharge of her duties as the member of the service. Many women in the IFS have resigned after marriage. There was a famous *Muthamma*⁷ Case that went to Supreme Court and resulted in deleting this clause

- There are few women who come in the service. There is an indirect pressure on the women to marry in service to continue in the service
- There is stereotyping in some positions. Quite often the field positing's for women is not possible. Very rarely one can see a male officer appointed as the Dy. Commissioner DWCD. The culture, however, varies from state to state
- In services like postal services, Indian Revenue Service, etc. that have high proportion of women, the level of satisfaction is also higher as they are in larger number. Therefore having substantial number matters
- Sexual harassment in the service is less now. In the 1990s there was a study which brought out much anecdotal evidence where women complained about harassment

- Responding to a question raised by a participant "if a lady officer is not performing well and the male boss takes action and the lady terms it as sexual harassment then what is to be done", the speaker said that it is more of a question of enabling environment which restricts women officers/ staff from performing in certain positions. If women were in a situation where they do not have liabilities then this whole question of 9-5 service hours would not arise
- As more and more women join the service the environment will have to improve. Availability of toilets for women working on field duties is another major area of concern
- If one wishes to change things then there is a need for equality in assigning of duty. For example very few lady officers are placed as SO of police stations. Similarly in the recent Uttarakhand natural disaster no lady officers were allowed for rescue and relief work despite the fact that they were willing to serve there. In Norway it was legislated and in United Kingdom there is Gender Equality in Duty Act to promote gender equality
- It is important to use gender friendly language. In United Nations the accepted language while giving example is 'she'

Summing up

Concluding the session, the speaker said that in order to bring about change there are four kinds of people: one who think out of the box (innovators) and willing to take the risk, second are loyal officers who follow the rule and the boss; third are the hesitators and fourth are the hardliners.

⁷ Chonira Belliappa Muthamma joined the Indian Forest Service in 1949. She was the first Indian female diplomat and also became the first Indian female Ambassador/ High Commissioner. She is known for her successful crusade for gender equality in the Indian Civil Service. She petitioned the government, claiming that she had been overlooked for promotion and that the rules governing the employment were discriminatory. Her case was upheld in the 1979 Supreme Court landmark Judgement.





6 9

Annexure



Training Framework

Day **1**

Session	Session Time	Торіс	Speaker
	0930 - 1100	 Opening Session Welcome by Ms. Ranjana Chopra, Joint Director & Director NGC- NIAR Key Note Address by Mr. Padamvir Singh, Director LBSNAA 	
1	1130 - 1215	Understanding Gender	Sarojini Ganju Thakur
1	1215 - 1300	Child Rights	Enakshi Ganguly
2	1400 - 1530	Gender Inequalities: Using An Institutional Approach	Sarojini Ganju Thakur
3	1545 - 1700	Gender & Development	Sarojini Ganju Thakur

Day 2

Session	Session Time	Торіс	Speaker
4	0930 - 1100	Breaking Social Norms I: Addressing Adverse Child Sex Ratio	Rizwan Parwez
5	1130 - 1300	Breaking Social Norms II: Child Marriage	Dora Giusti
6	1400 - 1530	Child Malnutrition and Government Programmes	Dr. N.C. Saxena
7	1545 – 1700	Gender & Forestry	Dr. N.C. Saxena



_{Day} **3**

Session	Session Time	Торіс	Speaker
8	0930 - 1100	Closing the Gap for Adolescent Girls	Joachim Theis
9&10	1130 - 1530	Violence Against Women	Flavia Agnes
11	1545 - 1700	Sexual Harassment at Workplace	Jaspreet Talwar

Day 4

Session	Session Time	Торіс	Speaker
12	0930 - 1100	Gender & Livelihoods (Kudumbshree Experience)	Sarada Muraleedharan
13	1130 - 1300	Trafficking of Women and Children	Swasti Rana
14	1400 - 1530	Gender Budgeting	Sarojini Ganju Thakur

Day 5

Session	Session Time	Торіс	Speaker
15	0930 - 1100	Analysing Organizations through a gender sensitive lens	Sarojini Ganju Thakur



Profile of Resource Persons





Dora Giusti

Dora Giusti studied Development Studies at the University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK and completed an MA in International Child Welfare, School of Social Work at the same University. She worked for NGOs in Peru and Latin America in 1999 and 2000 and then became Child Labour Desk Officer at Defence for Children International, International Secretariat in Geneva, Switzerland, in 2001. In 2003, she joined UNICEF and has worked in child protection in the UNICEF offices of Guatemala,

DRC, Georgia and the Innocenti Research Centre. She is currently based in the UNICF Country Office for India. She has looked over a wide range of issues, including children without parental care, trafficking, sexual exploitation, juvenile justice, orphans and vulnerable children, child marriage, gender-biased sex selection and child protection in emergencies.

Dr. N. C. Saxena

Dr. Naresh C. Saxena worked as Secretary, Planning Commission (1999-2002), Secretary, Rural Development (1997-99), GOI and Director of the National Academy of Administration, Mussoorie (1993-96), where he also taught during 1976-80. He is a member on the Editorial Board, Development Policy Review, London, International Forestry Review, Oxford, and the Royal Swedish Academy of Agriculture and Forestry, Stockholm. He was a Director for the ADB Institute, Tokyo from 2002-2004. He was



Visiting Professor on Forestry to the Regional Community Forestry Training Centre, Bangkok during 1993-98. On behalf of the Supreme Court of India, Dr. Saxena monitors hunger based programmes in India. He chaired the GOI Committee on identification of the poor in 2009. Currently he is chairing a GOI Committee to look at the implementation of the Forest Rights Act, 2006. He did his Doctorate in Forestry from the Oxford University in 1992. He was awarded honorary Ph.D from the University of East Anglia (UK) in 2006.



Enakshi Ganguly

Enakshi Ganguly is the Co-founder and Co-Director of HAQ Centre for Child Rights. HAQ has undertaken pioneering work in the field of child rights especially related children and governance and child protection. Its work on budget analysis since 2000 had led to the Government of India adopting it in 2003. Although very small in its size, it has now both a national as well as an international reach. Enakshi works with and supports children who are victims of

violence and those who have been unfortunate enough to come in conflict with law. As part of her work, she trains police, teachers, members of the judiciary and children themselves, and has been part of government's committees for drafting laws and policies. She was member of the Steering Committee for Women and children for the Eleventh and Five year Plan. She has several books and publications to her credit. She was awarded the Ashoka Fellowship in recognition her work.

Flavia Agnes

Flavia Agnes is a women's rights advocate and a legal scholar. A pioneer of the women's movement, she has worked consistently for over three decades on issues of gender and law reforms. She is the co-founder of MAJLIS, a Mumbai-based Centre for rights discourse and interdisciplinary arts initiatives. The Legal Centre of Majlis addresses issues of gender and human rights advocacy, provides quality legal services to women and children and imparts skills of feminist lawyering through training, advocacy and interching. Through her active intervention. Mc. Agnes has available.



internships. Through her active intervention, Ms. Agnes has evolved innovative legal strategies which have helped to secure rights of hundreds of battered women in the city of Mumbai and thousands of women in the state of Maharashtra. Her autobiographical essay on domestic violence titled, 'My Story Our Story ... Of Rebuilding Broken Lives' is an important marker of the Indian women's movement and has been translated into several languages and has provided inspiration and a ray of hope to tens of thousands of women and has helped them to come out of the situation of humiliation and degradation and make a new life for themselves. Flavia Agnes has brought women's rights to the forefront of the Indian legal system. Her widely published writings have provided a vital context for feminist jurisprudence, human rights law and gender studies in India Significant among her many publications is her book, 'Law & Gender Inequality – The Politics of Personal Laws in India' (1999), an Omnibus, 'Women and Law' (co-edit) (2003) and Negotiating Spaces Legal Domains, Community Constructs and Gender Concerns (co-edit) (2012). Her recent book Family Law (OUP 2011) in two volumes has been published as a text book for law students. For last two years, Majlis has started a programme in Mumbai to provide socio-legal support to survivors of sexual violence and has been using this exposure and knowledge to bring in changes within state institutions such as the judiciary, the police and the prosecution to bring in reforms which will help to maintain dignity and respect to the survivor and help in the process of ensuring that fair trial norms are maintained in a rape trial and the victim is not subjected to secondary victimisation during the trial. More recently, the Department of Women and Child Development, Government of Maharashtra has entered into a collaboration with Majlis Legal Centre to initiate a state level programme RAHAT to provide support to the survivors of sexual violence.



Jaspreet Talwar

Jaspreet Talwar is the Deputy Director (Sr.) Graduated in Science from MCM DAV College, Chandigarh. She completed LLB and LLM from Punjab University and was awarded UGC Junior Research Fellowship for pursuing Doctorate in Laws before joining the IAS. Was trained in Ropar district before being posted as SDM in Tarn Taran (then Amritsar district). Later served as Additional Chief Administrator for both Anandpur Sahib Urban Development Authority (ASUDA) and Punjab Urban Development and Planning

Authority (PUDA); Additional Registrar, Cooperative Societies and Secretary, Punjab State Electricity Board. She served as Deputy Commissioner of Fatehgarh Sahib district from 2005 to 2007. Was serving as Special Secretary, Finance & Tourism along with charge of Director, Institutional Finance & Banking and Disinvestment before joining the Academy in April 2009. Her areas of interest include Infrastructure and PPP, Health, Tourism, and Finance.



Joachim Theis

Joachim Theis took up his assignment as Chief Child Protection with UNICEF India in March 2013. He worked from 2008 to 2013 as Regional Child Protection Advisor with UNICEF in West and Central Africa, based in Dakar, Senegal. From 2004 to 2008 he worked as UNICEF Regional Advisor for adolescent development, protection and participation in East Asia and the Pacific, based in Bangkok, Thailand. From 2000 to 2004 he worked with Save the Children Sweden and UK in East Asia and the Pacific promoting rights based approaches and shildren's participation. From 10



rights-based approaches and children's participation. From 1993 to 2000 he managed Save the Children UK's programmes and coordinated research on child labour and child poverty in Vietnam. From 1989 to 1993 he was programme manager with Save the Children US in the Gaza Strip. From 1986 to 1989 he worked in Save the Children US's emergency relief and development programme in Sudan and coordinated baseline surveys, monitoring and evaluation. Prior to working in humanitarian work, development and child rights, Joachim carried out ethnographic field research in Sudan for his PhD in social anthropology. Joachim is a German national.



Md. Rizwan Parwez

Md. Rizwan Parwez has been in the social and development sector for the past twelve years when he completed his master's degree in Social Work. He worked with Centre for Advocacy and Research at New Delhi, and in these past 12 years assumed progressive roles working on gender and development issues, particularly on the issue of declining child sex ratio, daughter aversion and sex selection. 2005 onwards, he started working on direct intervention projects on sex determination and the

implementation of the PCPNDT Act in Rajasthan and worked closely with the state officials, legal and medical fraternity, civil society organizations, community and panchayat representatives. Especially in the last five years, he has focused on generating responses on *self-regulation*, medical ethics, declining child sex ratio, entitlements of girl child and reproductive rights of women across stakeholder entities. He became a member of the National Inspection and Monitoring Committee (NIMC), Ministry of HFW, GoI in 2011. Presently, he is associated with the Civil Society Campaign Against Declining Child Sex Ratio, initiated by UNFPA and NFI.

Sarojini Ganju Thakur

She is currently working as a consultant, retired from the IAS in April this year as Additional Chief Secretary in Himachal Pradesh. She has had a long association with issues related to gender and development, and it was during her posting in the Academy as Deputy Director that gender was mainstreamed into most training programmes and the Gender Centre was established. Amongst the many post she has held are also included the post of Joint Secretary in what is now the Ministry of women and Child Development - (the



National Gender Policy for the Empowerment of Women and the initial steps towards gender budgeting were taken during her tenure). She was Head of the Gender section at the Commonwealth Secretariat where she worked for over 4 years and on retirement was in charge of the women and child sector in HP. She has worked previously and continues to work as a consultant for bilateral/multilateral agencies such as UNICEF. UNIFEM (now UN women) and DFID on gender and environment issues.

ø

Joint Training Program on Gender and Child Rights



Sarada Murleedharan

Sarada Muraleedharan, is an IAS officer belonging to Kerala Cadre of 1990 batch. Currently, she is working as the Chief Operating Officer in National Rural Livelihoods Mission (NRLM), Ministry of Rural Development, Delhi. During her six year tenure with the Government of Kerala she has worked as the Director Scheduled Caste Development, Commissioner of Rural Development, District Collector, Trivandrum, Secretary Culture, Secretary Social Welfare and Executive Director of Kudumbashree, Kerala.

Swasti Rana

Swasti Rana did her graduation in Political Science from DU, followed by Masters in International Relations from JNU. Having secured the LSE-DFID scholarship for the year 2004-2005, she did a second Masters in Human Rights at the London School of Economics. Having worked with NGOs in India for a number of years on child protection issues and access to information, she joined the UN in 2007. Since the last 6 years she has been working with UNODC in the area anti human trafficking in the South Asia region.





 \bigcirc